THE COUNTY COUNCIL OF THE CITY & COUNTY OF CARDIFF

The County Council of the City & County of Cardiff met at City Hall, Cardiff on Thursday 30 January 2014 to transact the business set out in the Council Summons.

Present: County Councillor Derrick Morgan (Lord Mayor in the Chair): County Councillors Ali Ahmed, Dilwar Ali, Aubrey, Bale, Bowden, Boyle, Bradbury, Bridges, Burfoot, Carter, Chaundy, Clark, Richard Cook, Corria, Cowan, Davies Davis, De'Ath, Derbyshire, Evans, Ford, Goddard, Goodway, Gordon, Govier, Graham, Groves, Hinchey, Holden, Howells, Hudson, Hunt, Hyde, Javed, Keith Jones, Margaret Jones, Joyce, Kelloway, Knight, Lent, Lomax, Love, Magill, Marshall, McEvoy, McGarry, McKerlich, Merry, Michael, Mitchell, Murphy, Parry, Patel, Phillips, David Rees, Dianne Rees, Robson, Sanders, Simmons, Stubbs, Benjamin Thomas, Graham Thomas, Huw Thomas, Thorne, Walker, Walsh, Weaver, Craig Williams, Darren Williams and Woodman.

137 : APOLOGIES

County Councillors Ralph Cook, Lloyd & Manzoor Ahmed.

138 : WEBCASTING AND RECORDING OF PROCEEDINGS

Members were reminded of a decision of the Constitution Committee on 10 July, 2008 to webcast the Council meeting. Members were also reminded that the Constitution Committee had previously agreed that Council proceedings be recorded for administrative purposes.

Formal approval to record the proceedings was agreed.

139 : MINUTES

The minutes of the meeting of the County Council meetings held on 19 December 2013 were approved as a correct record and signed by the Chairperson subject the following corrections: - County Council of the City & County of Cardiff 30 January 2014

402

Page 368 - Min No 131 – addition of a missing paragraph in the question from County Councillor Dianne Rees to the Chair of the Planning Committee.

'In view of this aspiration, was it in keeping with the rhetoric for the Council, in a departure from its own Plan in force, to recommend the Planning Committee grant an application to build 1020 houses on grade 2 and 3 agricultural land (some of the finest in the region) on land north of Bridge Road, Old St Mellons, which is farmed for production of local potatoes, sprouts, cabbages, wheat, barley, rapeseed and oats, when the Welsh Assembly Government had objected to the application because of loss of agricultural land?'

Page 359 – Min No 130 – addition of a point not minuted under the item Treasury Management Mid-Year report.

'A member raised the example of Oldham Council where they have added value in their Banking Contacts through increased staff volunteering with the provider and engagement with schools in financial literacy.'

140 : DECLARATIONS OF INTEREST

The Chairman reminded Members of their responsibility under Article 16 of the Members' Code of Conduct to declare any interest, and to complete Personal Interest forms, at the commencement of the item of business.

There were no declarations of interest made.

141 : ANNOUNCEMENTS

(i) <u>Congratulations</u>

The Lord Mayor advised Members that Councillor Lyn Hudson was to receive the merchant Navy Welfare Board Certificate of commendation in recognition of her contribution to the work of the Port Welfare Committee and the Merchant Navy Welfare Board and congratulated Councillor Hudson on her achievement. County Council of the City & County of Cardiff 30 January 2014

403

 (ii) Members will recall that Council at its meeting in November 2013 agreed to continue with the pilot procedure rules as amended by the Constitution Committee. The Lord Mayor advised Members that copies of the pilot Council procedure rules were available in the Chamber

142 : PUBLIC QUESTIONS

<u>COMMUNITIES, HOUSING AND NEIGHBOURHOOD RENEWAL</u> <u>QUESTION</u>

Question:

Paul Callaghan

Every exempted tenant lessens the total liability upon Cardiff's rentalaccount (both in terms of arrears, pre-action protocol, potential-evictions and consequential rehousing costs). Against a backdrop of Westminster cuts and the resulting financial pressures on Welsh Local Authorities, will Cardiff Council work with its Housing Benefit Department to actively promote, publicise and facilitate tenants' right to appeal a 'bedroom-tax' housing benefit decision?

Reply:

County Councillor Thorne

Yes, the Benefit Section is very proactive in ensuring that the claimant's right to appeal is promoted at every opportunity.

Every housing benefit decision is notified in writing and these letters provide customers with details of their right to appeal. A fact sheet is available at the Advice Hub or on the Council's website and can also be sent to customers on request. Customers can get advice about appealing by visiting the housing office or Hub. They can also receive assistance in making an appeal by visiting the advice hub.

All appeals are considered by a specialist Adviser who will thoroughly check any decisions based on the facts and relevant legislation, including any case law which applies. Customers have a further right to appeal to an Independent Tribunal should they remain dissatisfied with the decision.

Every effort is made to ensure that customers receive the right benefit. The Department for Work and Pensions has recently agreed that there is a

loophole in the bedroom tax rules which applies to some tenants who have been in receipt of benefit since 1996. Officers have proactively identified those tenants who meet the criteria and are amending the claims and contacting the tenants without the need for those tenants to appeal.

Supplementary Question: Paul Callaghan

Could I ask the Council to write to all tenants advising them that if they have been in receipt of benefits since January 1996 they are exempt from the bedroom tax as a number of people are unaware of this new loophole.

Reply:	County Councillor Thorne

Its just that I did say in the response that all tenants who are affected by this have actually been contacted. If you believe that is not the case, and I know that we spoke downstairs in a meeting about the bedroom tax, and we give this information which is provided by Officers. If you believe that this is not correct I would appreciate it if you would contact me and let me know and I will check it out because we really do want to make sure that anybody who is affected by this, I will check with Officers, it may be that they have not been contacted but that there benefits have just been amended. But I will check if perhaps I could speak to you outside now.

EDUCATION AND LIFELONG LEARNING QUESTION

The Lord Mayor advised that Questions 2, 3, 4 & 5 were on related topics, the Questioner for Question 4 was not in the Chamber, Question 4 was therefore withdrawn. The Lord Mayor advised that in order to allow sufficient time for all questioners to ask a supplementary question, Councillor Magill had agreed to provide one answer to address the three questions. Members were advised that all questions had been circulated around the Chamber.

Question:

Gareth Hooper

Following the concerns raised by the recent Children and Young People Scrutiny Committee, are Members satisfied that officers have now carried out a business justification assessment including an options appraisal to justify the proposed closure of the nursery at County Hall?

Question:

Laura Knight

Cardiff Council is currently considering a proposal to close its workplace nursery in County Hall, to help meet its budget deficit for the upcoming year. Whilst the outstanding quality of this nursery has been acknowledged verbally, very little recognition has been given to the fact that the nursery provides a value to the Council that goes beyond the financial realm – not least, facilitating parents in their return to work, and supporting the Council's commitment to Early Years Learning and 'Work-Life Balance' policies. How will the Council ensure that this qualitative assessment is represented in the decision making process?

Question:

Cheryl Owen

Cardiff Council is currently considering a proposal to close its workplace nursery in County Hall, to help meet its budget deficit for the upcoming year. A significant proportion of the nursery's outgoings are premises costs of £59000 per annum. How does the premises cost for County Hall Nursery compare to the market rate for other providers across Cardiff?

Reply:

County Councillor Magill

Thank you for your question Mr Hooper and thank you to Ms Knight, and Ms Owen too for your questions about the nursery.

As the Lord Mayor has indicated, following advice from the Council's Monitoring Officer, I will seek to provide a composite response to all of the Public Questions, which relate to the decision that was taken by the Cabinet on the 16th December 2013 to consult on the proposal to close the nursery facility at County Hall with effect from 31st August 2014.

Following today's meeting, we will be publishing for consultation our draft budget proposals for how the Council is going to meet a budget deficit of over £50 million from 1 April 2014 to 31 March 2015. Having to achieve this level of savings in one financial year is unprecedented and means that we will need to make significant changes to existing provision and will have to make many very difficult decisions.

The proposal for the nursery that will be in these papers reflects the recent consultation regarding the proposal to close this facility. During the

course of the consultation a number of potential additional users were identified, which combined with a potential reduction in staff numbers and an increase in fees could possibly enable the Nursery to run without a subsidy.

In answer to Mr Hooper's questions, I can confirm that officers, therefore, have been asked to re-examine the business case for the County Hall Nursery and to report back to Cabinet in June 2014 on the feasibility and sustainability of providing the nursery without a subsidy. A final decision will then be made on whether or not the nursery will have to be closed from 31 August 2014.

I hope that the parents who currently have children in the nursery and any potential users of the County Hall Nursery will recognise that through this response I am providing to you today, together with the proposal that is being published later today, both I and the Education Directorate have listened to what has been said to us through the recent consultation on the future of the nursery.

I have always made very clear that the quality of care and provision at the Nursery is outstanding and has been widely recognised through the consultation process by existing and former users and externally by the regulatory body for childcare, the CSSIW. I agree with Ms Knight, that the nursery has certainly contributed to the Council's range of support for staff to return to work, to access work flexibly and contributes to achieving work-life balance.

However, due to falling demand for places, through a combination of greater flexible working arrangements for staff, childcare vouchers and alternative providers, the subsidy being met by the Council has increased significantly. To put this into context, over 300 staff use childcare vouchers for other childcare arrangements compared with the 21 staff who use the nursery at County Hall.

The actual net cost of running the nursery to the Council in the financial year 2012/2013 was £130,000, which for an average occupancy during that year of just over 10 places meant that the subsidy per place was just under £13,000. We cannot justify this level of subsidy for staff and relatives of staff. This subsidy is more than some working parents in the city would earn in a year.

The position for this financial year is projected to get even worse and in the current financial context of the Council, we can't afford this continued financial risk.

Officers have consulted with staff and parents regarding this proposal and have undertaken a survey of Council staff via email and the intranet. The Children and Young People Scrutiny Committee have also considered the proposal.

Officers received responses from most parents using the nursery and over 300 staff via the email survey and analysis of the responses will be made available to parents.

Ms Owen and a number of people responding to the consultation have asked questions about the financial costs associated with the County Hall building. I can confirm that I have sought and received assurances from the Council's Section 151 Officer that the accommodation costs for the Nursery provision are correct. That other providers may have relatively lower premises costs does not give us a basis for not fully taking into account the cost to the Council of providing nursery facilities at County Hall.

Many consultees have questioned whether more should have been done to market the nursery.

On the one hand, officers have been able to show me what has been done over a significant period, using a variety of different media, without it having an effect on take up and, on the other, parents have suggested that if we had used other methods, the take up would have increased.

Interestingly, within the responses made to the survey, 68% were aware of the nursery, even though only 31% currently use any form of childcare service – so awareness of the nursery is higher than has been assumed. Nonetheless, it was important that 17 members of staff responded positively to the question of 'whether they would be interested in a place at the Nursery now?'

With that in mind, I have asked officers to re-examine the business case for the nursery on the basis that there is no Council subsidy for 2014/15 and, in particular, to look at:

- ways to reduce costs which may involve releasing staff interested in voluntary severance;
- increasing fees;
- engaging with existing users to identify market strategies to increase occupancy; and
- testing the external market for potential alternative providers.

Officers have been asked to report back to Cabinet in June 2014 on the feasibility and sustainability of providing the Nursery without a subsidy.

If the Nursery were to close, there is available childcare provision within the vicinity of County Hall and the childcare voucher scheme can be used with any registered childcare provider of choice.

The Family Information Service would also help employees in finding alternative childcare, either close to their place of work or close to where they live.

Supplementary Question: Gareth Hooper

Whilst we welcome the acknowledgement that there is a possibility that there is a business case which can be made in support of the nursery, the revised proposal this afternoon merely defers the decision by a further 6 months whilst the proposed closure date remains the same. The impact of the children and the parents on this is significant given that the revised proposal would only allow 8 weeks for children to be placed in an alternative nursery. We contend that the impact of this proposal has not been thoroughly assessed and would welcome details of this revised assessment. In addition we contend that the additional time which has now been allowed for the revised amendment isn't sufficient to enable the marketing which has been presented by the parents in consultation with the Education Department to take effect and propose that the additional time is required to enable that to take effect with the proposed revised closure dates set at least 12 months in advance.

Reply:County Councillor Magill

I appreciate that this is a very difficult situation for parents but nonetheless we have got, as I said, a very significant financial issue to deal with from the Council's point of view, so what we would need to do in order for the nursery to continue is to be satisfied that it can run in a

way that is found where the subsidy isn't needed. That, I think, needs to be the focus of attention, if we are satisfied that the subsidy won't be required then I would be delighted for the nursery to be able to continue but it is going to have to be continuing on that basis.

In terms of the arrangements for taking this forward we are intending to arrange a meeting for parents and staff for feedback on the consultation and survey in the week commencing 3 February 2014 and the idea is then to arrange a task and finish group which will include parents and staff to re-examine the business case in the way that we have described. I think it will be a judgement for parents as to whether they, in tandem with this process, look for alternative arrangements at the same time or not that is very much a choice for parents.

Supplementary Question: Laura Knight

I think I am covering what Gareth was saying in that, as parents you can understand that there is a big question mark now raised over whether this nursery is going to remain open and therefore parents who were looking at a 3-5 year period for child care must look elsewhere before perhaps even considering it now because there is a question mark over the viability of the nursery therefore a specified extended period date as to when the nursery would close would help us perhaps get in and reinforce in parents to use the nursery now rather than already decide before this has even been extended or discussed further not to do it, and therefore it is detrimental already in the minds of parents who potentially could have thought of using this as a facility, so yes we would like to have a definite date if there is going to be extended as to when the nursery is considered to be closing so other parents can consider whether to use that in the short term or whether it will be a viable long term arrangement.

Reply: County Councillor Magill

I think one of the first things that the officers need to do is to get back to people who have taken part in the survey, it was done on an anonymous basis so it would have to be back to everybody to see if we could identify the staff that said they would be interested in taking up places now. If that is in place then we can start to build a picture where it would be possible to put a viable situation in place but as I said unfortunately the subsidy has to come out of the budget because of the pressures on the budget as a whole, so I think it is a question of trying to stabilise the

position in reaching a decision about viability as soon as we can because we can't continue the subsidy past the time that is written into the budget proposals.

Supplementary Question: Cheryl Owen

Can Councillor Magill confirm whether an alternative occupier for the nursery premises has been investigated and whether without an alternative occupier the nursery premises would actually be a loss of revenue for the Council if the nursery were to cease to operate?

Reply:County Councillor Magill

Again I have asked the Officers to actually explore that with potential alternative providers. The Childcare Strategy Team had the working assumption that it wouldn't be viable for other providers to come in and operate the nursery but I have asked them to actually test that now in the market place rather than making assumptions around it.

If the nursery were to close, in terms of what would happen to the space, we have a lot of operational property around the city and so what we would look to do would be to move some more staff into County Hall releasing other premises for which there might be a capital receipt and which we could use the proceeds of to reduce our borrowing costs, so it would actually, benefit the Council financially to be in that position.

143 : PETITIONS

The following petitions were submitted:

<u>Councillor Cowan</u> –I have been given a petition to present to Council today on behalf of 471 people. County Hall Nursery providing high quality child care for Council staff since 1988, the nursery and its staff are an asset to Cardiff Council, the undersigned want Cardiff Council to reconsider its proposals to close County Hall Nursery in 2014 and let it remain open.

<u>Councillor Dilwar Ali</u> – I have a petition from local residents, the petition is against Cardiff County Council granting planning permission for the building of a supermarket on the site of James and Jenkins, Station Road, Llandaff North, Cardiff and signed by 52 people.

144 : NOTICE IN VACANCY OF COUNCILLOR

Members received a report notifying them of a vacancy in the office of Councillor, in the Electoral Division of Canton following the Resignation of Cerys Furlong from the office of Councillor with effect from 31 December 2013. The by-election will take place on 20 February 2014.

Councillor Richard Cook gave a statement in which he outlined the reason his ward colleague had had to resign as Ward Councillor for Canton, due to her conflicting responsibilities of being a Councillor, having a young family, a small business and a new high powered job as a Director of the National Institute of Adult and Continuing Education. Councillor Cook praised Cerys Furlong for being a great ward Councillor who had played a full part in developing the role of this Council for the benefit of the city of Cardiff and not just within her ward.

In conclusion Councillor Cook praised Cerys Furlong for her service to the Council and wished her well for the future.

<u>Point of Clarification</u> – Councillor Woodman noted an error in the Financial Implications of the report which states "two elections" when there was in fact only one.

RESOLVED – That the vacancy in the office of Councillor for the Electoral Division of Canton be noted.

145 : STATEMENT OF THE LEADER OF THE COUNCIL

Update on Proposed Restriction of Access to Payday Lender Websites

The Leader in her statement provided Council with an update on work which was being undertaken currently by the Council's ICT service to implement a request for the restriction of Internet access to 'payday lender' websites. This follows previous enquiries which have been made by Members in relation to this matter.

I can confirm that officers are currently working to assess the extent of application of any block or restriction of Internet access to the Council's two systems – i.e. the 'corporate' network and/or the 'non-corporate' or public network, which covers access in schools, libraries, community

County Council of the City & County of Cardiff 30 January 2014

412

education, enterprise centres and our free public internet provision on Cardiff Freezone.

In terms of access to categorised websites via the 'corporate' network, the Council's current supplier uses a generic 'Financial Services' category, which includes normal banking sites along with payday lenders, rather than a specific 'Payday Loan' category. As a result, the Council will need to create, validate, monitor and update a manual list in order to ensure that only payday lenders are blocked, subject to an agreed definition and classification of such providers.

In terms of the 'non corporate' network, the Council's supplier uses a category called 'Payday Loans', which should already contain the details of those sites that meet this criteria which have been added by the supplier. It is not possible for the Council to view this list as it is effectively the intellectual property of the supplier. However, the Council would benefit from the fact that the list is managed by the supplier, which is therefore responsible for updating and maintaining the list, together with any related issues or challenges.

ICT officers are developing a 'block page' to be displayed when people try to access a payday loan/lender website, which can contain a message containing the reason(s) for blocked Internet access. This could also potentially include links to the websites of selected alternative financial services organisations, such as credit unions (subject to agreement), if this is considered to be appropriate.

With reference to schools, ICT now provides a delegated service to schools which enables Headteachers to be more flexible and apply greater discretion about the websites to which they allow access. They can also make changes instantly without waiting for input or permission from ICT. This empowers greater understanding and accountability within schools by letting them decide to override the central policies, where appropriate (with exception to extreme categories such as pornography, terrorism and drugs etc. which are always blocked).

The Council also supplies internet access to the Welsh Local Government Association (WLGA) and the Cardiff & Vale Credit Union. As independent organisations, the Council allows those organisations to set their own Internet access policies and restrictions, so any proposed

changes which are implemented by ICT would not be applied to those organisations unless they made a specific request for it to do so.

Officers will consult relevant Cabinet Members on proposals in advance of any formal decision in relation to this proposal. I will seek to provide Members with an update on this work in due course.

In response to comments made by Members, the Leader confirmed advice had been obtained in relation to concerns about any potential restraint of trade challenges; she confirmed support to the Credit Union and will look into the question of whether a consistent message is being advanced when considering the advertising policy and estate strategy and protecting the most vulnerable in the city.

146 : CHILDREN'S SERVICES STATEMENT

Crosslands Children's Home

Members were advised that Crosslands was the only registered children's home run by Cardiff Council and is located in the Ely ward of Cardiff. An unannounced, focussed inspection of the home was undertaken by CCSIW in December 2013 and the draft report has recently been released to Cardiff Council. The draft report was very positive and the inspection found that many aspects of the service met the needs of the young people with regards to their care and development.

Crosslands staff and young people use Restorative Practice, an approach which encourages children and adults to take responsibility for their actions. This approach focuses on resolving conflicts at the earliest possible stage, seeking to avoid blame and supporting people to take responsibility for finding a constructive solution to issues. It encourages effective communication and working towards positive outcomes.

Members will have access to the full CCSIW inspection on release. In the meantime, I would like to acknowledge the findings of the inspection and congratulate the Manager, Siobhan Teague and staff at Crosslands Residential Home for their continued hard work and commitment to improving outcomes for children who are looked after by this Authority.

147 : FINANCE AND ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT STATEMENT

Budget Statement

My Lord Mayor and Members of the County Council

I beg your leave to present the statement agended in my name in relation to the majority party's draft budget proposals for the 2014/15 County Council Budget.

My Lord Mayor

This budget statement is presented against a continuing backdrop of a draconian austerity programme imposed by a dogmatic Westminster based Coalition Government intent on wreaking havoc on the most valued public services delivered by the finest of public servants to the most needy and vulnerable citizens in our society.

The recession and the Coalition's welfare reforms are having a brutal impact on citizens and communities in Cardiff, and are putting ever greater strain on Council services and on the Welsh public sector generally.

In addition, there are demographic trends which need to be considered. Cardiff is one of the fastest growing cities in the United Kingdom. We are all, as a society, growing older. These trends will have a major impact on Council services such as schools, home care for the elderly and on waste management.

And for us as a Council is the inescapable responsibility that goes with being the capital city of our country. As figures from the Centre for Cities this week demonstrated, Cardiff plays the fundamental role in driving the Welsh economy. It's a role that cannot be neglected. On the contrary, for the sake of all our people, it's a responsibility that we have to discharge with increased determination.

However, it has to be said, that the Cardiff Council Taxpayer alone can no longer be expected to fund or subsidise the facilities or activities or services which capital city status demands and the draft proposals which will be published later today begin to reflect the new order.

So today the Council again faces the serious challenge of immediate, severe and ongoing budget cuts. Immediate and increased pressure on Council services as a consequence of the London Government's attack on public services. Long term demographic changes which will put increased demand on Council services.

These represent serious challenges to the way we in local government do business.

The re-election of a Con/Dem coalition in 2015 would only serve to make things far, far worse. However, the sad truth is that the need to eliminate the budget deficit over the lifetime of the next Parliament is unlikely to make things better.

So, whatever the outcome of the 2015 general election, it seems that these challenges are not going to go away.

As such, my Lord Mayor, I think it is fair to say that this budget statement comes at a defining moment for Welsh Local Government. The draft proposals which we will publish later reflect the unprecedented scale of the cuts that we need to make to achieve a balanced budget next year and clear messages that this direction of travel is here to stay.

Change is inevitable. The First Minister himself has said that, in relation to local government and public service delivery, the status quo is no longer an option. The publication of the recommendations of the Williams Commission signals a direction of travel which Welsh Government believes could afford a level of protection to front line services through the achievement of economies of scale. In my view, the Williams proposals offer real opportunities for local government and the public sector to come together to make the most of scarce resources. Local Government Reorganisation will not allow us to avoid deep budget cuts but it could ensure that those cuts are not visited upon the people who need our services most.

My Lord Mayor, in the 29 years that I have served as a County Councillor in this city I have had to address some of the most difficult challenges that any local Councillor has ever had to face. I have to say, however, that this year's budget has posed a scale of challenge unprecedented in Wales and perhaps in the UK. No core city in the UK has had to respond to such a level of budget cuts in such a short period

and in the absence of any mitigating assistance whatsoever. This is certainly the most difficult and far reaching budget settlement the Council has ever faced.

I have frequently reported to the Council during the last year the constantly changing financial pressure leading up to the announcement of the provisional settlement in October. Regrettably, my budget statements served only to reveal an ever worsening set of budget scenarios.

In the event, Cardiff has had to absorb a funding reduction of some £15.8 million - 3.5% for 2014/15, a real terms reduction of some 6.2%.

In addition, Directorates have needed to address the challenges faced by some £33 million of unavoidable budgetary pressures which, when combined with the reduction in actual funding, requires service area "savings" totaling some £50 million next year. On top of that, the decision not to allow the capitalisation of statutory redundancy payments and changes in accounting practice have meant that some £13 million has had to be identified in the current year to finance the redundancy costs associated with the cuts that have to be made.

To minimise the impact of these costs we will be using £7 million from the Council's reserves to cover the initial costs of voluntary severance. We will, however, need to rebuild the Council's reserves following this, and revenue budgets will need to be allocated accordingly to ensure that the reserves are restored over the next two years. The Council will understand that the Cabinet is not willing to put the Council's future in jeopardy by ignoring the need to safeguard future reserves for the benefit of the Council.

As you can imagine, this has been an extremely difficult process and has required some very unpalatable decisions. Indeed it reinforces the maxim of the American economist J K Galbraith; which reminds us that politics is not the art of the possible it is a choice between the unpalatable and the disastrous.

Cuts at this level in a single year have never been attempted before and come on the back of what was already a very difficult budget settlement in the current year with directorate budgets having already been reduced by £22 million.

There is no easy way to make budget cuts at this level and whilst every effort has been made to minimise the impact on services, some reductions are inevitable. Feedback from the consultation process will of course be taken into account when finalising the budget proposals to be considered by Cabinet on the 20th February and subsequently by Council at its meeting on the 27th February as will the feedback from Scrutiny Committees and the School Budget Forum. Indeed it was in recognition of the need for consultation that the Cabinet received and approved a report on early consideration of proposals at its December meeting.

Whatever the outcome of the consultation the Cabinet has a duty to propose a balanced budget for the Council and this cannot be achieved without some very difficult decisions.

My Lord Mayor, an overriding theme of this year's budget discussions has been the Leader's determination to keep as many staff in jobs as possible. It was that determination which led Cabinet to reluctantly – extremely reluctantly – to propose a workforce agreement which, amongst other things sought to reduce the working week by an hour.

The results of the Union Ballots have been confirmed today. GMB, UCATT and Unite voted in favour of the proposals. However, Council will be aware that to reach a Collective Agreement we needed a "Yes" vote from each of the individual Trade Unions.

As a "No" vote has been returned by Unison members, the Council is unable to secure a collective agreement and therefore cannot implement the Workforce Agreement for 2014/15.

Cabinet respects the collective bargaining arrangements in place and has committed to continuing to work closely with trade unions, reiterating that no alternative package of measures would be implemented until all discussions with Trade Union colleagues were exhausted and all potential options fully understood.

But Cabinet believed that the Workforce Agreement would have enabled the Council to protect some 200 jobs across the authority and to preserve both our compulsory redundancy policy and the Council's voluntary severance scheme. In reality, both are now in jeopardy as we strive to achieve a balanced budget and, without doubt, that will result in additional job losses on top of the almost 700 that have already identified. My Lord Mayor, the immediate budget pressures are dramatic, but they are only part of the picture. We must also continue to deliver vital services to the citizens and communities of Cardiff during this period of rapid change. The Council also faces significant inflationary and demographic pressures that also have to be addressed in this and future budgets.

We have put in place some of the arrangements we believe are necessary to manage these pressures.

Deficiencies in the Council's managerial capacity identified by ourselves and reinforced by the WLGA's Peer Review continue to be addressed. The Council has a new Chief Executive and senior management team in place. They will provide the managerial leadership the Council needs to tackle the challenges we face and to deliver against our 3 priorities:

- Delivering education and skills for people of all ages;
- Supporting vulnerable people in times of austerity; and
- Creating economic development as the engine of growth and jobs.

As regards school budgets, the Cabinet budget proposals currently meet the Welsh Government's protection level for 2014/15. This requires an overall increase of 0.9% compared to 2013/14. This has been maintained despite the significant cuts required to other Council services. Even so, Cabinet recognises that this will still place significant pressures on school governing bodies when setting their budgets for 2014/15 and in meeting the pressures arising from the continuing need to improve the education of young people in the city.

The Council will appreciate that this investment is essential if we are to successfully deal with continuing challenges facing Cardiff's schools as face schools across the whole of the Country.

No member will need reminding of the problems affecting our social services. Unlike in previous years, however, no formal protection for Social Services has been built into the Welsh Government's settlement for next year. The Cabinet proposals reflect the continuing demand and increased levels of need in both Children's Services and Health & Adult Social Care and significant resources will be set aside to help meet the needs of the city's most vulnerable citizens.

418

The Council will be pleased to learn that our proposals do not provide for the closure of branch libraries or leisure centres but do commit the Council to looking to explore alternative ways of delivering these services in future years. The proposals do however commit the Council to identifying alternative providers or alternative arrangements to support our cultural venues in the immediate term.

We must also remember that our responsibility is not just to protect the jobs of those paid out of Council budgets and to deliver core services, but to do what we can to maintain and increase employment opportunities in other sectors of the economy too. As part of this sustainable future it is important to invest in our city's economy now, so that we create a competitive Capital City for the people of Cardiff and Wales, and help address concerns over jobs and opportunities for everyone, especially young people, in our city.

Consequently, we will be continuing to prioritise investment in the city to support these aims, and help reduce future costs for public services. The Council will work with partners to deliver projects to take Cardiff to the next stage of its development and reinvigorate the city's economy that has seen both employment and economic growth stall in recent years. Identifying options for a Convention Centre and Indoor Arena, supporting Welsh Government with the development of a city-region metro and helping Welsh Government to deliver a financial and professional services Enterprise Zone for Wales will not only create direct employment during the construction phases, but also provide the infrastructure that will help to develop, attract and retain businesses in the years ahead.

The papers which will be circulated later contain all the proposals we will be consulting on in the next few weeks and which will be accompanied by other important announcements that will be made by my Cabinet colleagues over the course of the next few days. Can I take this opportunity to record my sincere thanks to all of my Cabinet colleagues for the hard work they have invested in this process and for their willingness to work together to bring forward the proposals on which we are all agreed.

My Lord Mayor, I have made the case that severe budget reductions and increased pressure on public services have become the inescapable

419

reality, for now and the foreseeable future. The Cabinet acknowledges that the way we need to do business in Wales needs to change, and to change radically.

Much has been spoken about seeking new models of service delivery and exploring alternative delivery mechanisms in order to best protect jobs and services.

It is clear to us that at the end of this current administration the council will look very different from what it looks like today.

The austerity measures and budget cuts necessitate a local government which is smaller, and one which will need to be smarter.

The implications of the Williams Commission are that we in Wales will see the future of local government being larger, delivering efficiencies via economies of scale. In short, that means larger authorities delivering fewer services.

So with the state in retreat, a greater responsibility is going to fall on us all as citizens. In many cases citizens and communities will no longer be able to look to the Council for support or for the services that they have been used to. The Council simply won't have the resources and the capacity to respond.

That means we have to find others to deliver some of the services which communities value the most. Whether it is youth services or play services, looking out for your neighbour or major operators of facilities that will help reduce or eliminate current levels of subsidies the simple fact is that we will need to identify other service providers capable of delivering services at a much reduced cost.

Cabinet colleagues are aware that these new models are being developed and implemented by local authorities across Britain and that they need to take action to adopt and develop these in Cardiff as well as across Wales.

My Lord Mayor, I now turn to the matter of the Capital Programme for the next year.

Capital funding from the Welsh Government continues to fall, with a reduction of resources for the Council of 35.3% since 2010/11, a cash cut

County Council of the City & County of Cardiff 30 January 2014

421

of \pounds 7.3m. In addition we are faced with managing the financial implications of the 5 year Capital Programme established by the last administration and which runs until 2016/17.

Although the capital programme commits to an investment of \pounds 423 million over the next 5 years the number of new projects included is limited to just £18.9 million and reflects the administration's commitment to invest in the future of public services in our city. We have prioritised resources in those areas that will give real benefit in future years, and reflect the need to change the way that we deliver public services in Cardiff.

In particular £8.5m of this investment is allocated to the development of Citizen Hubs. This approach points the direction to a new path for public services at a local level.

This investment will allow us to put in place resources to help deliver better and more efficient services to people in our communities, closer to where they live, and in partnership with other service providers. These hubs will be the home of public services in the community, but, building on the points that I made earlier, it may not always be the case that the services delivered from them will be done so by the Council or traditional public service providers alone, but instead will need to be led by the citizens and communities themselves.

My Lord Mayor, the draft proposals being presented today will allow for a short period of public consultation, an opportunity for real scrutiny of our firm ideas about where cuts should be made and an offer to all party groups once again to submit alternative proposals in time for them to be considered by the majority party and the Cabinet in advance of the Council meeting next month.

My Lord Mayor and members of the County Council I look forward to discussing our draft proposals with you in the weeks ahead and to engaging in constructive debate when we next meet when I will deal in more detail with the specific numbers which has built next year's proposals.

I confirm the statement to the Council.

In response to comments made by Members, Councillor Goodway confirmed the commitment to commissioned services to replace those that had previously been grant aided; that for the next 2 years the first call on revenue expenditure had to be the repatriation of Council reserves, the Council has to be kept viable; the indications are that in the absence of a Workforce agreement there would be implications for the voluntary severence scheme and it would be difficult to sustain a policy of no redundancies. There was a need to drive efficiencies across the network and to take the necessary steps to protect front line services and the priorities identified to take forward. The Cabinet Member assured Members there would be no workforce redundancy notices pending the outcome of detailed discussions with the trade unions and only after every channel of negotiation had been exhausted.

There is a commitment to the Community Asset Transfer scheme, although it is uncertain as to whether or not it would be appropriate for cultural venues it will take some time but there is commitment to take this forward. The Cabinet are also committed to ensure that whatever the project, it must be self financing.

It is unachievable to go into this budget without an element of risk as a result precautions have been taken to build into the proposals a contingency fund in case the savings that have been identified cannot be achieved;

There is a commitment that school capital receipts will be reinvested in the School Operational Plan.

148 : COUNCIL TAX REDUCTION SCHEME

Councillor Thorne, Cabinet Member for Communities Housing and Social Justice introduced the report setting out Cabinet proposals to Council to agree the new Council Tax Reduction scheme from April 2014 as detailed in the report. The Cabinet Member advised that a report was brought to Council in 2013, there was a "sunset clause" which meant there was a need to consider it again this year. This scheme is part of the Westminster Coalition Government Welfare Reforms, it is a small part but would have had a major impact on residents of Cardiff and the result was that every resident no matter what their income would have had to pay 10% towards their Council Tax. As a result of the Welsh Government providing additional funding so that the support continued to

be based on 100% of Council Tax liability. This meant that residents who would previously have been required to pay the 10%, would no longer have to. There is still the need to consult on the scheme, however there are a number of areas that allow for some discretion. Consultation took place last year and the discretionary areas are laid out on page 2 of the report. Consultation has taken place again this year, those discretionary areas were agreed with and are listed in the report.

Members were advised that the "sunset clause" meant that the current scheme would have to cease from 31 March 2014 and a new scheme would need to be adopted.

Councillor Weaver seconded the proposal.

RESOLVED – That the proposals for a new Council Tax Reduction Scheme for 2014/15 as set out in the report be adopted.

149 : ORAL QUESTIONS

ENVIROMENT QUESTION

Question:

County Councillor Clark

Could the cabinet member confirm how much income and expenditure has been generated by introducing charges for bulky waste collections?

<u>Reply</u>:

County Councillor Govier

The operational costs I can confirm are reduced by £84k, in terms of income, we have generated £39,180 and in terms of the free provision for those on some form of benefit, that has been equivalent to the cost of £27,850 worth of free service provision.

<u>Supplementary Question</u>: County Councillor Clark

I was very proud that furniture being left out for weeks on end in the streets and lanes of Cardiff was practically eradicated by the end of the Lib Dem administration. Keeping in mind the large amount of fly tipping still left out around the city following the introduction of bulky waste charges and the bad old days do seem to be returning. How much extra do you anticipate is needed to fully clear Cardiff's streets of bulky waste that isn't being done now, and I just want to clarify, I don't think I received a reply to how much expenditure on collecting fly tipping is currently being spent following the introduction of bulky waste charges so there is two things there I am looking for clarification on please.

Reply:

County Councillor Govier

Fly tipping across the city has reduced by 35%. We are at a 5 year low in terms of fly tipping across this city in terms of reports. Our tonnages are reduced and the cost of dealing with them has reduced. There is a written answer to a question I think I was given in the written answers which deals with the fly tipping costs that is in front of you, there is an answer in there but fly tipping is an issue. We are doing well in terms of our response on the 5 days; we have a 95% response rate of collecting fly tipping in 5 days the issue can sometimes be if it is on private land and we do have an issue with that but we are continuously addressing it we have had more prosecutions, more fines and I would go as far as to say that, it is not just me saying, the facts are showing that what we are doing in this administration is far better than you did in your administration

Supplementary Question: County Councillor Craig Williams

I was interested in your answer and it is just a quick supplementary on that about land that is not owned by the County Council and the fly tipping. I have seen an increase in my ward about fly tipping and I have large areas of privately owned and community council owned, and by privately owned I mean the quarry which hopefully you will be aware of, it really has increased. What are you doing in partnership with the Community Councils and big private land owners to try and tackle the fly tipping menace which seems to be increasing?

<u>Reply</u>: *County Councillor Govier*

At the moment we are in discussion with the Welsh Government as part of the Anti-Social Behaviour Bill about changing some of the legislation to enable us to act quicker when it comes to private land so once we have finished those negotiations I think we will be in a better place to deal with private land but what you tend to find is that we are wrapped up in certain

424

legislation time frames, it is a frustration for us and the residents of Cardiff but we are in discussions with Welsh Government about what more we can get out of the current legislation so that we can respond quicker to the issues that you have identified.

FINANCE AND ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT QUESTION

Question:

County Councillor Craig Williams

Will the administration rule out increasing council tax by 5%, the maximum allowed by the Welsh Government cap?

<u>Reply</u>: County Councillor Goodway

Details of council tax proposals will be included in the section 151 Officer's budget report which will be presented to Council on 27 February. The Councillor will appreciate that the determination of council tax levels is a matter for the council itself.

Supplementary Question: County Councillor Craig Wil

Will the Cabinet Member be mindful in recommending the level of council tax that the residents of Cardiff are struggling as well as the budget of the County Council and to go anywhere near the maximum permissible increase of council tax would be extremely ill advised and I, on behalf of the residents of Cardiff, would like you not to.

<u>Reply</u>: *County Councillor Goodway*

I am sure that the Councillor by now understands that I am not likely to reveal the content of the final budget proposals at this meeting. However, I can tell you that in constant discussions that we have within Cabinet the Leader is anxious to ensure that we all understand the challenges that are facing people in the city with increase charges across the board in terms of energy costs fuel costs and the like, so we are cognisant of that but we also understand the importance of retaining important public services which many vulnerable people in this city cannot do without.

Supplementary Question: County Councillor Bradbury

Does the Cabinet Member welcome the admission from the Conservative benches that there is a cost of living crisis in this country and that suddenly those lot on those benches there, the aggressive benches, are worried about the pound in the pocket of the people of Cardiff. Could the Cabinet Member estimate, without going on council taxes, how much more with energy bills going up, with the rising costs of living in this country, how much he feels, how great this golden economic legacy that they are so called leaving us at the moment, because I haven't seen it in Caerau, I wondered if the Cabinet Member seen it in nearby Ely?

<u>Reply</u>: *County Councillor Goodway*

I think Councillor Bradbury is correct, that despite the rhetoric of the coalition government in London about the numbers that are coming out of the office of national statistics about the economic recovery. As valid they may be I have to say that I don't believe that there are any citizens that have felt touched by this increased prosperity. I don't see people queuing up believing that all of a sudden there has been this recovery in terms of their wellbeing in fact most people in real terms are now earning 89% of what they were earning before this government came into office. As far as Councillor Williams's conversion to the cause of fighting the cost of living I can only assume that he has been influenced by the campaign that has been going on in Cardiff North and the leaflet distribution that has been going through doors in Cardiff North which are getting that message home to the people in that constituency who are going to vote labour at the 2015 general election and no doubt as the conservative party candidate in that constituency Councillor Williams is now running scared.

SPORT, LEISURE AND CULTURE QUESTION

Question:

County Councillor Holden

At a recent PACT a resident and member of St Josephs bowling club informed me that they received a letter from the Council asking for £6250. This money is to cover maintenance of the club for the next financial year. What assistance has been provided to this club to date to help them raise these funds? County Council of the City & County of Cardiff 30 January 2014

427

Reply: County Councillor Patel

The Council has been in dialogue with the Club with a view to securing bowls provision at the Maindy site for the 2014 season and beyond.

The sum that you refer to represents the annual costs of maintenance activities to a blowing green and the Club has given commitment to buy back the maintenance service from the Council in order to sustain provision on site.

In terms of assistance provided, the Council has facilitated discussions with the Club and the Cardiff Third Sector Council for advice and support in respect of grant funding.

The Council has also provided the Club with a range of information relating to other funding opportunities from other grant sources and, as recently as Tuesday, officers along with the Club representatives attended a 'Re-thinking Parks Funding Workshop' hosted by NESTA, an innovation charity with a mission to help people and organisations through practical support and grants.

Supplementary Question: County Councillor Holden

The follow up question would just be, they have actually said that if they can't meet this money then it may very well jeopardise the actual social club which is attached to the bowls club. What I would like to ask is could you clarify either with yourself or the Cabinet whether or not myself and my ward colleague could use our Section 106 monies for green open spaces to give to the club to support it if we so wished, to support it for this next year whilst it was trying to find additional funding. Could you and answer that question thank you?

Reply: County Councillor Patel

My understanding of Section 106 is that we have to be very very careful – it depends on how the application was put in and what the purpose of it is, obviously you would need to discuss that with the officers, regarding the arrangement of the Section 106 so I could not individually comment on certain areas because I just do not know what the agreement was. Certainly I would welcome you to talk to the officers regarding this issue

County Council of the City & County of Cardiff 30 January 2014

428

if you feel that there is Section 106 which could possibly be used in that way but I think it would be quite difficult to do so.

Supplementary Question: County Councillor Bridges

At last month's full council you said you had been working with the club, or your officers had been working with the club and that you gave them a guarantee that they would be able to fulfil their fixtures next season, I understand that since then the club has been told that it may have to look at sharing facilities at Llwynfedw gardens in Heath and that all sorts of possibilities are being looked at between the club and your officers. I completely support what Councillor Holden says about seeing if we can find Section 106 monies to keep them at Maindy and I just wonder if you will undertake to take a personal interest in this matter and try and seek a dialogue immediately over the next week or so to try and give some clarity to the club and their ward Members to make sure that they can stay at Maindy for the foreseeable future. I think that that was what you wanted to give them an assurance about last month but the situation is constantly involving and so any interest you can show in this matter will be greatly appreciated.

Reply:

County Councillor Patel

I have always worked with the Club very closely, with the officers, and one of the Public Questions that was asked it was recognised that I was working very closely with this club but we have to give them all the options, the bowling clubs, there is a number of them, what we are saying to them all may be you need to get together and just talk to each other and decide where you think would be the best and most appropriate with the Community Asset Transfer there is all sorts of issues as well with that – whether they can raise the kind of capital they need, some of the facilities are in a lot worse condition than others therefore that dialogue is constructive dialogue, I would welcome any meeting with this club or any other clubs regarding this issue.

COMMUNITIES, HOUSING & NEIGHBOURHOOD RENEWAL QUESTION

Question:

County Councillor McEvoy

On what date was the first record entered on the ASBIT database in S Wales?

Reply: County Councillor Thorne

As confirmed previously in answer to your two Written Questions this month on this subject I am unable to provide this information as the database is not used by the Council due to the strict vetting procedures that are required by South Wales Police who are also responsible for the administration of the database and the information held on it.

429

I would therefore suggest that you direct your enquiries to them.

<u>Supplementary Question</u>: *County Councillor McEvoy*

I am sometimes suspicious when questions are ruled out of order as this question was today earlier, because I was told that the Council didn't own the database, but in December we all told that the Council actually does part own the database. What I would like to clarify is who on Cardiff Council is authorised to access ASBITS, the anti social behavioural database and do they do so? And I think that the fact that you have told me to write to the police on the other matters shows the huge gab in democratic accountability since we have had the commissioners because if you all remember that before the Commissioner Elections we were able to ask questions of the police authority here and I have written about this without success, it is an absolute scandal, just to reiterate the substantive question who is authorised to access ASBITS on Cardiff Council and do they actually do so?.

Reply:

County Councillor Thorne

I believe that I have answered that question in saying that no one does because we are not allowed to.

COMMUNITIES, HOUSING & NEIGHBOURHOOD RENEWAL QUESTION

Question:

County Councillor Marshall

Can the Cabinet Member for Housing advise Council how she intends to address the shortfall in social housing across the City, and particularly within my Splott Ward?

Reply:

County Councillor Thorne

There is a major shortage of affordable housing across the city and this is something that I take very seriously.

The Housing Partnership project will deliver around 1,600 new units across Cardiff and on Council land, including one site in the Splott ward, with at least 40% of these being new Council houses. This is the first major Council house building programme for decades.

Officers are also working in partnership with the local housing associations to maximise the delivery of new affordable units across the city through the Social Housing Grant. This will invest £4.2 million per year for the next three years in the provision of social housing. This programme will deliver around 422 units over the next few years, including two schemes in Splott that will deliver 37 units. If more grant funding becomes available, we will be ready to bring forward schemes to deliver a further 214 units.

Officers are also working proactively to negotiate the delivery of new affordable units on private development sites of 10 properties or more, including any new Local Development Plan sites that will come forward.

While we are doing all that we can to increase the amount of social and low cost ownerships in the city, we also need to encourage private landlords to rent accommodation to benefit claimants and this is an area we are working on as well.

<u>Supplementary Question</u>: County Councillor Marshall

Just in the meantime how are we ensuring that residents and tenants in Splott have appropriate and timely advice and information about their housing need because obviously it is a current crisis?

Reply:County Councillor Thorne

It is a bit of an issue I guess at the moment because you will remember that we introduced a new housing allocation scheme and the database is being updated which will make it much plainer for people to understand where they are on the list and what their options. We do have the scheme, the housing options centre where when people are waiting they can actually go in there, have a personal interview and they are advised

about what the best options are available to them because sometimes waiting for a Council property, depending on where they are on the list, may not always be the best option.

Supplementary Question: County Councillor Howells

Following the decision in Cabinet in relation to the Splott Community Hub could you commit that the Star site will be allocated purely for social housing either through the council building the houses themselves or through working with a local housing association.

Reply:County Councillor Thorne

What I can confirm is that local Councillors will be consulted about whatever goes on that site but part of the partnership programme is about this, moving money from one area of land to another so where you building private development and selling those properties, that money gets invested in developing social housing, now if that is the best option for that site and I hope it is because there is a dire need for social housing then that is what will happen but it will be as part of a discussion with the local Members.

ENVIROMENT QUESTION

Question:

County Councillor Chaundy

In view of the Council's commitment to reduce litter, dog mess and also increase household recycling, would the Cabinet Member for the Environment please confirm special bag for those items will remain available and free to residents?

Reply:

County Councillor Govier

As you know we have got the Waste Strategy under way at the moment but we have no plan to introduce charges or take away the provision of green bags or bags for food, what I am looking for officials to do is find out a way that we can to control the supply a little bit I think because what we tend to find is that our bags end up all over the place, including other authorities. So I would like them to look our supply and how effective that is.

In terms of the dog fouling bags I am pleased you recognise our commitment to tackle this and promote more responsible dog ownership

we have got huge increases of enforcement and have put 3000 dog stickers around the city and introduced the 24 hour clean up. The dog fouling bags are provided by the grant, at the moment we are unclear if that grant will come through and I am not at the moment minded to take that spend into the revenue. I do think part of the responsible ownership of dog owners is to also provide the bags themselves to clear up dog fouling, in particular because it is about 50 pence for 500 nappie bags in most supermarkets and I am not minded at the moment to take the free dog fouling bags and put that into the revenue if the grant does not come through.

Supplementary Question: County Councillor Chaundy

That is rather unfortunate. I think that as dogs and bags obviously are very important, they go together it seems. If you have got to pay for them it may well be that access is a problem. My question would be, will, as far as you can make aware, all appropriate bags available through Council premises in the near future. Many of the council premises presently have run out of dog 'poo' bags and it is obviously going to become a problem and I feel that if you want to concentrate on dog waste it would be appropriate to concentrate on giving the bags away.

Reply:

County Councillor Govier

I am not sure that that is the solution to ensuring that we deal with the dog mess in our streets, I am pretty sure that the dog mess in our streets is happening now even if we provide free dog fouling bags so I do believe that the responsible dog owners out there would not mind paying a couple of pence to get themselves 500 free dog fouling bags I am not sure that that is going to be an issue. What we do need to do is to keep on pressing to those irresponsible dog owners that we will fine and enforce. There has definitely been a change in this administration, I think that there was one fine between 2008 and 2012, we have done 90 since we have been in office, 6 prosecutions and we have got the 24 hour clean up. We are just looking to address it in a different way I do not think that responsible dog owners will allow their dogs to foul when they cannot get free dog fouling bags when they can spend 35 pence in a supermarket and pick up 500.

<u>Supplementary Question</u>: County Councillor Richard Cook

You have answered the first part of my question that we are in fact fining more dog owners than was done in the previous 4 years. Can you confirm how many PCSOs have been trained recently and whether the PCSOs in Canton ward have been trained to issued fines for dog mess please?

Reply:

County Councillor Govier

In terms of our partnerships and again looking to put more emphasis on enforcement and promoting responsible dog ownership we have almost 180 PCSOs now trained to issue dog fouling fines. Only on Wednesday of this week we trained the new intake of PCSOs some 70 were in County Hall for this training so I think that that is part of the reason we are seeing the increase in enforcement and we look forward to working with other partners, whether it be in the council, in terms of Parks, Park Rangers have issued over 50 fines since they were trained. We are working quite well in terms of our enforcement ability on the streets of Cardiff and I do think it is deterring some irresponsible dog owners and making them think twice.

QUESTION TO THE LEADER

Question:

County Councillor Walker

Following a recent meeting of the Reservoir Action Group (RAG) with affected councillors and AMs, an action plan was agreed. A key element of the plan is the preparation of a costed technical report on refilling Llanishen Reservoir and potentially restoring the site to its former state. When RAG has completed and approved the report, will the Leader meet elected members and RAG representatives to hear the proposals?

Subject to her agreement with its content, will she then make use of her regular senior level meetings with Celsa to present the report and encourage Celsa directors to strongly consider its recommendations?

Reply:

County Councillor Joyce

You might be already aware that we are already working very closely with both RAG and Celsa to create a sustainable future for Llanishen Reservoir.

Officers from the Economic Development Directorate are, at my request, working directly with RAG to support their development of proposals for re-filling the reservoir and for its longer term future.

We are committed to facilitating discussion on RAG's proposals with Celsa once these are ready. I will, of course, keep elected Members updated on progress.

This is a very high profile issue and I fully understand the level of interest in the future of the reservoir; however, we do, all of us, need to give RAG and other stakeholders, and Celsa the time and space to develop workable proposals.

<u>Supplementary Question</u>: County Councillor Walker

I thank the Leader for her response and the very positive moves that are already being made in helping RAG to fulfil its ambitions.

One issue that was raised at the meeting that several of us attended was whether the people you might be meeting in the UK have the seniority to make decisions about the future of the reservoir and that many of the directors are based in Spain or somewhere else. I just wondered if you could reassure us about whether you feel from your contact with Celsa that the people you meet have the authority to make the decision about the matters that I have raised.

Reply:

County Councillor Joyce

If necessary Councillor Walker I will go to Spain to speak to the ones who have the final authority, if need be I will have to go to Spain but I will not stay long.

County Councillor Hunt sought clarification as to whether he was required to declare an interest as he was a member of RAG.

Lord Mayor:

I have been informed there is no need to declare an interest.

STRATEGIC PLANNING AND TRANSPORT QUESTION

Question:

County Councillor Holden

Following the notice of motion passed in November stating that you will consult further with local members in Gabalfa prior to making the improvements at Gabalfa interchange permanent, what consultation have you actually done with local members in Gabalfa?

Reply:

County Councillor Hinchey

I should clarify first that the amended motion which was passed by Council in November last year asked the Cabinet to:

'continue to monitor the South side proposals until after the Christmas and New Year period in order to gather further data before making a decision on this part of the scheme'.

And you have had letters to confirm that. I can also confirm that this was done and the decision was made to complete the scheme on the South side of the interchange. This decision was based on the fact that there have been no injury collisions on the south side during the last six month period and this is backed up by collision data and therefore the primary objective has been achieved.

<u>Supplementary Question</u>: County Councillor Bowden

I just wonder Councillor Hinchey as far as data is concerned I did draw attention to the concern that I had that about the traffic that would be using the UHW site to avoid Gabalfa interchange on its journey along Western Avenue I have had no data given to me about that to satisfy us as local ward councillors that in actual fact traffic isn't diverting off through UHW and causing them a problem.

Reply:County Councillor Hinchey

As you probably aware we have had ongoing consultation with not just the police and other emergency services but also the UHW senior managers as well. There haven't been any adverse comments received from UHW although we have recently engaged with them about traffic management and parking around the Heath Hospital as you are aware. As far as we are concerned, we will be looking on-going at both the north side and south side and even further afield where there are areas like the

UHW, but also other big employers perhaps the old tax office would be another example I would use where we want to try and convert, genuinely want to try and convert people onto public transport and fulfil the ambitions of the LDP

STRATEGIC PLANNING AND TRANSPORT QUESTION

Question:

County Councillor McEvoy

Through which streets in Fairwater will the projected rail run as part of the LDP transport proposal?

Reply:

County Councillor Hinchey

There is currently no definitive alignment for the rapid transit corridor route through the north west of the city, which has been a long standing ambition for the Council as you were aware when we came up to Fairwater to talk about the LDP.

Further detailed work will be undertake to, firstly, determine the precise technology, what will it be and, secondly, the route alignment. Additionally, the analysis of consultation responses and continued partnership working with relevant bodies will help to inform this considered view.

We are working with Rhondda Cynon Taff as part of the regional study to identify alignments through the north east alignment and are likely to recommend a tram-train as the option we will progress. The study is expected to be published towards the end of March 2014 and obviously I will report back.

Can I also, whilst I have got 2 seconds, tell Council that we are progressing the LDP and we will have a further consultation on Monday just to remind people.

<u>Supplementary Question</u>: *County Councillor McEvoy*

If you look at the LDP technical papers - north west corridor study - two options. I don't think it is good enough to say that the line of the rail has not yet been decided because on the map it is pretty clear. If you live in Fairwood Close, Cranwell Close, perhaps Grantham Close then it is going to go right through your houses, mass demolition; we would be looking at if this option were taken. I would like to know where the train station

would go, and if that option is going to be ruled out because you did mention tram but am not sure in what context, are we going to see a one way car system through Cowbridge Road East that is the other option which you guys have voted for, two bus lanes, no cycling, no on street parking, that will be the future of Canton.

Reply:

County Councillor Hinchey

I am sure that Members of this Council can see the leaflets wanting to be printed as we speak but I won't fall for that one Neil. Obviously, we are looking at this, I just said about technology, until you come down on what technology it is going to be how you can look at what alignments they are going to be. We are not going to set fear amongst people in Fairwater; we are not going to fall for that. Unfortunately, you talk about bus rapid transit through Canton, and you are going to set fear amongst people there, we are not going to do that either. We will come to a sensible conclusion, we have ambitions for Cardiff, you are aware of them and Scrutiny I believe, welcomed the presentation I did very recently, so I would guess Neil the best thing to do is to sit down and listen to the ambitions of Cardiff we are not going to make the mistakes that you are trying to push us into stating. We have ambition but we also have very good plans too.

<u>Supplementary Question</u>: County Councillor Aubrey

I am glad to hear that progress has been made in terms of Rhondda Cynon Taff and the possibility of a rail route, the Cabinet will be aware that I have been talking in this Chamber since I was first elected about there being a rail route in this area and I am surprised that it has taken this long for anyone to notice that there is a conflict at the point where it joins in with Fairwater.

In terms of question I just wondered if the Cabinet Member could arrange for Members, subsequent to the meeting, to have some advice on the powers and the responsibilities that the Council has when land is required in projects of this sort where there is a conflict between the current land ownership and the requirement for the project.

Reply:County Councillor Hinchey

I do respond in the same sort of way once we know what technology we have got we will obviously look to reduce any disruption or involvement

of, as Council McEvoy wants us to do, talking about residents - full streets being knocked down, that is just not going to happen and we will talk with residents at that time, if there are changes to be made. We are having ongoing discussions with Welsh Government and with Mark Barry's project that he is bringing forward, so until we are at that stage then we will have firmer details to work with and of course we will involve you in that.

ENVIROMENT QUESTION

Question:

County Councillor Knight

Will the Cabinet be bringing forward a new policy for buskers operating in Cardiff City Centre?

Reply:

County Councillor Govier

I am not going to make a song and dance about this. I think the recent issue did invoke some public interest in the city centre so I have asked officials to look at developing some code of practice for busking in the city centre.

Supplementary Question: County Councillor Knight

I know that previous Cabinet Members for several years have looked at areas of busking and I think that clear practice is required for the help of both buskers and residents, and shoppers and pedestrians that use the city centre, so I would welcome any movement to help clarify those possibilities to people.

Reply:

County Councillor Govier

What I identified in the recent issue was the lack of a code of practice which in essence meant it did cause issues when you are trying to balance the issue of the busking and the various shopkeepers in the area and I do think we need a code of practice agreed by all, this case is actually helping us develop that code of practice along with the city centre management team.

<u>Cllr Bradbury</u> - During the last question to Cllr Hinchey, after the question was answered Cllr McEvoy got up and shouted 'you are a liar' and directed it at my colleague Cllr Hinchey that is a Code of Conduct issue, the Council has several other questions left to be answered and a

motion I would like a ruling on this, and at the very least ask Cllr McEvoy to withdraw that remark. He may not have liked the answer but I would never call any other Member from another party a liar and I don't think he should be allowed to do so either. I think that that is wrong.

Chair:

Could I just say that comments have been made to me about the statement that was made and the comment that was made by Cllr McEvoy. We have spoken to Cllr Hinchey we will be talking about this during the recess and I will inform you of an outcome afterwards.

Point of Order: County Councillor Mitchell

Regarding this question there has been a lot of social media comment naming streets and I have had people ringing me up worried about a blights upon their houses by presenting imaginary alignments as a potential short term. I would ask that this be looked into as a matter of urgency; this is not the way a responsible senior Councillor should behave.

Chair:

I have just been informed that this is not a Point of Order and should be dealt with outside of this Chamber Paul.

CHILDREN'S SOCIAL SERVICES QUESTION

Question:

County Councillor Boyle

In the briefing paper from the Director of Children's Services, dated 6 December 2013, reference is made to 'inept attempts to redirect [services for disabled children] strategically during the summer of this year'. What in particular was 'inept and what was the impact on service users?

Reply:

County Councillor Corria

As you point out in your question the briefing paper was prepared by the Director of Children's Services so, in his absence this week, it would be inappropriate for me to second guess as to exactly what he refers to. I can discuss this matter further with him on his return to work and I can get back to you in writing.

440

<u>Supplementary Question</u>: County Councillor Boyle

I sort of assumed that because it was a brief paper to yourself you might have asked him what he meant in that briefing paper so we are left really with not much idea about what was 'inept' about efforts over the summer. Would I be correct however in thinking that a large part of the failure over the summer was that parents had not been properly involved in helping to shape the future direction of the service, that in fact they had been marginalised, and if that is a correct summary can you tell us, in broad headline terms, what is being done to ensure that parents are involved in reshaping the service, what they are telling you they want and what you have told telling them you can deliver?

Reply: County Councillor Corria

You were actually present at the scrutiny committee where the briefing paper was presented so you actually had the opportunity to ask the Director yourself which is why we have s meetings so that you can ask the questions.

I think that probably some of the measures that were taken in the summer were possibly reactive and there was no longer term planning. In terms of communications with parents, yes, admittedly that was not very good. I think, with the best of intentions, the Officers tried to implement changes but when you do something quite quickly you are in danger of not communicating properly and that is basically what happened.

At a senior management meeting recently the new manager for child having disability presented her plan, which is quite a robust plan which is will be coming back to scrutiny in March with very strict time scales so that everything can be implemented. In terms of communication with parents there is an element of that in the plan and obviously we want to make sure that parents are engaged as much as possible so that they can help plan service delivery and review service delivery so that the needs of children can be met.

Supplementary Question: County Councillor Jonathan Evans

At the outset I would just like to thank the Director of Children's Services for producing such a cogent and candid report that highlights the risks

441

and challenges in the system. I think that it really represents a refreshingly honest professional appraisal. Could I though press you a little on the detail about the improvement plan that you are putting in place in response to that report and perhaps maybe go a little bit wider in terms of the context of recruitment and retention and staff development and so forth?

<u>Reply</u>:

County Councillor Corria

I think that what underpins good service delivery in Children's Services is a motivated and safe work force so absolutely the recruitment and retention of social workers is urgent we need to make sure that we reduce our agency rates, currently is about 40% we would like it to be zero. In terms of the improvement plan it is going to be looking basically at every single aspect of Children's Services but underpinning absolutely everything is a motivated and safe work force and that has to be the priority over and above everything else.

FINANCE AND ECONO MIC DEVELOPMENT QUESTION

What is the latest progress on a new City Centre bus station?

<u>Reply:</u> *County Councillor Goodway*

The Council remains committed to providing a new transport interchange as part of the comprehensive regeneration of the areas north and south of the Central Train Station which fall within the Welsh Government Central Cardiff Enterprise Zone. I can confirm that work has commenced on the master-planning of the entire area which will include first class facilities for bus, rail and metro users.

Supplementary Question: County Councillor Hudson

As this administration is committed to sustainable travel I hope it is sustainable but I also hope that it is less problematic and a lot clearer because it is very confusing at the moment to have a proper hub in the city centre where it will be easier to access trains and buses.

I also want to highlight the plight again of our disabled who cannot access easily the city centre due to badly placed bus stops and connections to continue for onward travel. Please let our city centre not become a suburb but a proper city centre. Can I have that assurance please?

Reply: County Councillor Goodway

From the Councillors remarks I am pleased to say she shares my ambition.

<u>Supplementary Question</u>: County Councillor Aubrey

I welcome the start of the master plan and obviously Members across the chamber will be very interest in its results.

I just wanted to check that the priority in that master planning process is ensuring that the design and the specific site of the bus station within the greater complex will prioritise its efficient operation within the current bus network because there are a number of sites that could be used that would be very inefficient and a number of sites that could be used which would provide much greater efficiency than we have at the moment.

Reply:County Councillor Goodway

Well of course the top priority has to be the needs of the transport user, the public transport user so that will be an integral part of the design of the master plan. The other priority that we are seeking to achieve is to ensure that the new facility can be operation 365 days a year and does not have to close on event days and then the other thing we are looking at is how we can perhaps re-open St Mary Street to buses as one of the corridors to enable the more effective flow of transport through the city.

STRATEGIC PLANNING AND TRANSPORT QUESTION

Question:

County Councillor Cowan

Are there any current proposals or discussion taking place regarding bus lanes on the A469?

Reply:

County Councillor Hinchey

The A469 is a key transport corridor that needs improvements to public transport, cycling and walking in order to encourage more people to choose sustainable and attractive alternatives rather than travelling by car. These improvements will not only provide for existing residents, but will also help to accommodate future development within the city.

The LDP seeks to achieve a 50:50 split between car-based and non-car based travel. Achievement of many of the Plan's key objectives will be dependent upon developments being integrated with the provision of extensive and high quality sustainable transport infrastructure including improvements on the A49 corridor.

High level corridor options have been investigated in the north east of the city, including the A469, the reports of the work are included in the appendices of the background transportation technical papers and assessments in the Deposit LDP.

There have been discussions with the developers of the strategic sites in the Deposit LDP regarding these options, particularly with regard to the achieving a network of routes in the north east of the city providing choice of destinations. The work involves further consultation and continued partnership with authorities on our neighbouring boundaries.

<u>Supplementary Question</u>: County Councillor Cowan

Councillor Hinchey I think my question asked whether or not you had any discussions taking place really? Can you just put on record whether or not you have any meetings or discussions since you took up your post with any interested parties or Councillors that could be affected by these proposals?

Reply:

County Councillor Hinchey

The answer to your question is yes we had some recent conversations and Councillor Hudson attended one of those. We are also having further consultation with the Gabalfa Members, but we will also be looking further afield to look at other key corridors as well.

444

Supplementary Question: County Councillor Woodman

As we are talking about bus lanes do you now have an answer to my question I raised at Cabinet yesterday as to whether the community alarm service will be allowed to use the bus lanes once your new enforcement rules come in please.

Reply: County Councillor Hinchey

The short answer to your question is yes.

CHILDREN'S SOCIAL SERVICES QUESTION

Question: County Councillor McEvoy

What is the Council's policy in Children's Services accepting reports from domestic charities written non-judgemental?

Reply: County Councillor Corria

Children's Services treats all referrals received in line with the All Wales Child Protection Procedures and our own internal procedures. We do not have separate policies for referrals from separate or specific agencies.

<u>Supplementary Question</u>: County Councillor McEvoy

I am aware of that. The question really is whether or not you would carry out a review of these issues and third sector involvement in private law proceedings with the purpose of implementing a policy on these kind of matters if, if the concerns are valid and my case file tells me that these concerns are very very valid.

Reply: County Councillor Corria

I think that the best way forward is for us to have a meeting with the Corporate Director of Children's Services and the appropriate manager from intake and assessment because we can have lots of questions in council, we can have lots of emails pinging back and fore - we need to sit down we need to discuss the issues and we need to look for a way forward.

<u>COMMUNITIES, HOUSING AND NEIGHBOURHOOD RENEWAL</u> <u>QUESTION</u>

Question:

County Councillor De'Ath

A high-profile private landlord recently issued eviction notices to tenants in receipt of social security, and refused to accept new applicants claiming housing benefit. The National Landlords' Association published figures in December, which showed that the number of private landlords letting to people on benefits has halved to just one in five. Could you outline the situation in Cardiff?

Reply:

County Councillor Thorne

I recognise that private landlords are important partners in the provision of accommodation to low income households and it is important that we encourage them to continue to let good quality accommodation to benefit claimants.

Since 2008, there has been a 100% increase in the number of housing benefit claimants living in the private rented sector in Cardiff.

There are now 10,600 claimants living in this type of accommodation and this exceeds the number living in housing association properties.

In addition, whilst there has been an overall reduction in benefit claims this year, the number of claims from private sector tenants still shows a slight increase.

There is no evidence that private sector landlords are refusing to let to benefit claimants in Cardiff and I can tell you that I have been working with the Private Sector Landlords Forum and we have set up a working party to see how we can help support those landlords who are prepared to let to people on benefits.

<u>Supplementary Question</u>: County Councillor De'Ath

Several UK Government reforms to the welfare system such as upgrading local housing allowance annually by the lesser of either the consumer price index or the rent officer's review are intended to cause private sector rents to fall rather that money to be taken away from some of the

people who have the least in society. Can you tell me Linda whether private rents have fallen in Cardiff over the last few years?

Reply:

County Councillor Thorne

Off hand I can't answer that question but I will check but I don't think that there is any evidence that it has fallen is my personal view but I will check.

<u>Supplementary Question</u>: County Councillor Carter

Thank you Councillor Thorne for that answer I think we are all grateful to know that in your interpretation the figures are not correct and actually there is not a crisis here. I think that even if that is the case across the piece and from your own figures we all have examples across in our communities where this is happening where landlords, good landlords in many cases are worried about letting to social tenants because of their concerns about defaults on rent and places getting, problems with the tenants. I was wondering what work and programmes are you working on in your department to try and assist landlords and try to make social tenants far more attractive. Whilst it is great to have investment in social housing, private sector is a key resource here and the last thing we want to do is to see a situation where more landlords are less willing to house such tenants.

Reply:

County Councillor Thorne

I did say that we are working with private landlords and the Private Landlords Forum. We have had one event, round table, where we talked to landlords and asked them what their concerns were and how they felt that we could help them, but it was the intention to set up a working party with a small group and Officers and I would like to attend myself because I have some ideas and I have spoken to them about it. They use Solicitors to take tenants to Court for non-payment of rent, we never use solicitors we use officers. There are lots of things we can do to assist them to reduce their overheads, but the other thing as well is making sure that we are working closely with them so that immediately someone who is a tenant and that they know is on benefit falls into arrears or has a problem that we can actually help them and deal with it. We do recognise that there are lots of good landlords in Cardiff they make a huge contribution

447

to renting to people who are on benefits and we want to make sure that that continues.

EDUCATION AND LIFELONG LEARNING QUESTION

Question:

County Councillor Bowden

The Council and Welsh Government rely on Governing Bodies to be leaders within their individual schools and certain training has now been made mandatory for Governors by Welsh Government. If Governors do not complete mandatory training within specified timescales, Governing Bodies have a duty to suspend them until they have done the training. Given that some of the training is currently not available from Governor Services. Could you advise me on what Governing Bodies should do in these circumstances; and what the Council is proposing in terms of meeting the demands for mandatory training?

Reply:

County Councillor Magill

The Education (Wales) Measure 2011 included provision for the Welsh Ministers to make regulations to make training mandatory on specific issues. Mandatory training for governors came into force from September last year in relation to:

- Induction for new Governors;
- Understanding Data in schools;
- Role of Chair; and
- Clerks although local authority Clerks are exempt from this training.

The Governor Services team with the Education and Lifelong Learning Directorate has been working with the Central South Consortium on this; Central South Consortium has some responsibilities of its own in relation to the training for Governors. They will be providing the Understanding Data training, the rest of the mandatory training is being organised through external trainers so to provide the other three course I think it might be helpful if I ask Governor Services to write out to Heads of Governors confirming the dates that are being put in place for all those branches of training.

448

<u>Supplementary Question</u>: County Councillor Bowden

I think you understand my concern here for Governing Bodies. The time scales, I have seen from Neil Hardee today and outline as to when the training is likely to be taking place, but it is months away and given the requirements that we have as Governors to adhere to the rules that Welsh Government have imposed upon us as Governing Bodies and understandably so we are not going to be able to meet those deadlines and added to which, I have mentioned this to you before, the building of Ty Dysgu is not accessible as easily as somewhere like County Hall. The car park is too small and it is very difficult to get people who have disability issues into that building and into the car park itself I have been unable to access the building myself as you know and I think this really needs to be addressed urgently.

Reply:

County Councillor Magill

As you say the training is mandatory and some of it has to be completed by September 2014. Given what you have just said I will seek assurances that there are sufficient courses being commissioned and extra dates are being commissioned now. We are also working with the other authorities in the consortium so that we can give access to Governors to training in other areas to help catch up the back log but I will seek assurances that that this is the case.

In relation to the accessibility issues of Ty Dysgu, you have raised that with me and I believe that is still being investigated, but if that is not accessible for people sufficiently then obviously we need to be looking at other venues.

<u>Supplementary Question</u>: County Councillor Boyle

Broadening things out a little beyond purely the mandatory training, though this comes into it, I wonder whether you would agree, and this is based on personal experience, that some of the formal training sessions are sub-standard or aren't as useful as they might be and we need to explore more innovative ways of delivering training, you could argue for example that a Governor sitting in on a meeting with their schools Headteacher and their Finance Officer provides a more useful level of financial training than sitting in Committee Room 4 in County Hall and

that we need to find innovative ways of delivering training that perhaps we are not currently not exploring.

Reply:

County Councillor Magill

I would like to broaden out even further than that I think we have got real issues about governance for schools across the whole of the city at the moment. We see the reports coming through month by month with gaps in terms of appointments for Governors all over the city. It is something that Nick Batchelar and I have talked a lot about since his appointment and we are taking steps to try and strengthen governance arrangements in particular ways. Training is one thing and as I have just been indicating we need to start commissioning training rather than trying direct provision so that it is of a high enough quality but we are also working directly with the Business Council and with partners through the Educational Development Board which I set up that started working in the autumn and as a starting point we are trying to link every secondary school and then every primary school with a business in the city so that we can actually get business leaders and people with a matrix of skills into the governance of schools this isn't just about supporting literacy and all the good project work that is being done it's about actually getting a commitment to work on school governance. We are aware that is an area which needs strengthening and we are taking steps to do that.

ENVIROMENT QUESTION

Question:

County Councillor Graham Thomas

Dog fouling is a big problem in wards right across the City. I welcome the Council's crackdown and desire to do something about it. Please confirm how much was raised in fines for dog fouling in 2013 and with the new crackdown what the target is for 201.

How much will the new 24 hour response on cleaning up dog mess across Cardiff cost and is it realist that fines will pay for the operation?

Reply:County Councillor Govier

In 2013 we raised about £7000 in dog fouling fines. In 2014 - we don't necessarily target the team to go for fines; we don't give them a fine target. I think that there is an ethos in the public sector that they want to

see the local environment improved and what we have done is to take them away from the liberal approach of the previous administration to one of a zero tolerance approach and that in itself is producing the results which have seen the significant growth in dog fouling fines for irresponsible dog ownership.

The 24 hour response and how much will it cost, as you know we have made some changes to the clearing operation we have made them a lot more mobile we have also looked at addressing the teams to areas where the need is the greatest and what we are expecting now is for issues of dog fouling that are reported, it will go out to the ward teams, being that they are mobile they can address dog fouling within the 24 hours and in the same way we have seen an improvement in the fly tipping statistics, just a bit of a performance indicator, I think, to give them that a focus I do expect to see dog fouling come off our streets, reported dog fouling, it has to be reported, reported dog fouling coming off our streets within 24 hours.

Supplementary Question: County Councillor Graham Thomas

Councils across the UK have all had the same problem and the common conclusion seems to be that enforcement is the best way of tackling this issue so I would ask that Cardiff keep enforcement as their number one priority in the issue as well. Both in from a point of view of stopping the perpetrators in their tracks and also paying for the new scheme although I do see a funding imbalance between this new 24 hour cleaning operation and paying for it through fines. We obviously need to keep a close eye on that one. Can you just confirm for me though, just as a question, when the new scheme is due to start and how residents should report it?

Reply:

County Councillor Govier

Again thank you for recognising our commitment to the increase in enforcement. I do think we have to be careful and make sure that we continue the education message. Where the fine income is coming in , and we have ring fenced it so it does go back into education the complete zero tolerance campaign that we ran was funded by fine income so it's those who are committing the offence that are paying for the response, I think that is right. In terms of when the scheme is likely to start, I would confirm that it has already started and we are managing it, we are already performance indicating it and I think in the next 3 months when we look

at the results of the new cleansing regimes we will also begin to look and bringing forward the results of how we have responded. People should report it in the same way through C2C and Councillors.

<u>Supplementary Question</u>: County Councillor Kelloway

Can you confirm that the scheme applies not just to streets but also to parks and open spaces as well, and how one might direct Council Officers to a parcel of dog excrement in the middle of Roath Park rec, those with mobile phones may be able to give GPS location for it. It is a serious point. I recently carried out a survey in Cyncoed Gardens, where I actually walked around the gardens and spent some time doing it. I actually counted 36 parcels of dog excrement there. How might one report that to officers and expect them to go there. Will they carry out a sweep of the open space or do they need to have more precise location for the offending matter in order for it to be removed within the required 24 hour period? That is a serious question.

<u>Reply</u>: *County Councillor Govier*

The 24 response at this present time really is focused on the highway which is where the environment cleansing team have responsibility. As you know phase 2 of Cardiff Outdoors will look at synchronising the cleansing teams so they will begin crossing on to parks and housing land so that we do not have separate teams. The 24 hour response at the moment I can only commit to happening on the highway land.

In terms of reporting it, longer term we are looking at apps really, dog phone applications, email. At the moment we do not have that technology in the IT system which is why people will have to report it through the traditional channels of Connect 2 Cardiff; the location will be presented to the person on the other end and they will send it to the waste team who will then deal with the issue. Longer term we will look at synchronising the cleansing teams so that the same response time can be done in parks and housing land but at the moment it is just the highways.

ENVIROMENT QUESTION

Question: County Councillor Robson

Following the majority of Consultees opposing monthly black bin/bag collections, will you rule out this idea permanently?

<u>Reply</u>: *County Councillor Govier*

This is the first time I have been asked this question, we may be slightly before the curve; there are some Councils I know currently that are actually implementing monthly and three weekly collections, including one in Wales. I think what we were asking residents was could they manage, we weren't asking would they take the monthly collections we were asking could you manage with a monthly question and what we were trying to gauge was how the recycling agenda is filtering through to the people of Cardiff. I was surprised with figures such as Eric Pickles and Jeremy Clarkson against it, I was surprised that 40% of residents were either yes or don't know in terms of managing with the monthly collections. I have seen some of the breakdown data and you can see the areas of the city of where those responses came back, already reporting very nigh recycling tonnages anyway. We would not permanently rule this out I can't see us introducing this in the waste strategy that we are bringing forward and I don't think the people of Cardiff are ready for that kind of change. We are going to be asking them to go through pretty significant change in terms of the kerbside method when only 4% wanted that, so at the moment that is the challenge officials are on as opposed to looking at monthly black bag collections, but it certainly did give us some interesting data in terms of the different challenges we are facing in the city.

Supplementary Question: County Councillor Robson

I am pleased to hear that you have ruled it out certainly in the interim period based on the consultation results. I did think that it was a very strange idea that was put forward in terms of the whole raft of consultation ideas, I thought that one really wouldn't be a goer, I wondered if it was just a tactic almost to take away some of the publicity away perhaps for some of the ideas which you would actually like to do which may not be quite so popular as you have indicated in your answer about kerbside recycling. You managed to get the big press, Cardiff has Reply:

been a slight laughing stock because of the national press and some of things that various celebrities have written about us. It is unfortunate, but would you agree that in the future you will be a bit more careful with your publicity if you are consulting on making changes to waste.

County Councillor Govier

I wouldn't necessarily take Eric Pickles view of what Cardiff is, in terms of its view in terms of consultation, we have been asked to present our agenda at the National Waste Management conference, which is UK wide and as I have said other Councils are already implementing the policies we were consulting on,. I do think we were ahead of the curve but like I said it was very interesting to see 40%, that is still a significant number which is much higher than those who are in favour of kerbside which is our EU directive so 40% said they could manage or don't know if they could manage this was really interesting because what we know from our compositional analysis is that 80% of what is going in black bags can go into one of the recycling collection operations that we currently run. I think we have to move residents to come away from black bags as being the normal area of putting waste away and we have to help bring in that behavioural change it is local authority and governments that do lead that behavioural change we should be ahead of the curve and not finding out where the crowd are going and trying to run to the front of that queue. We need be leading the crowd so I do think it was a good piece of information to put in there and we have definitely got some informative feedback that is helping us construct a waste strategy and more importantly our educational messages, I don't think we can have the same educational message in an area which is 15% recycling compared to Lisvane at 80%. It has given us interesting information.

FINANCE AND ECOMNOC DEVELOPMENT QUESTION

Question: County Councillor McEvoy

When will residents be allowed to run Pentrebane Community Centre through Community Asset Transfer?

Reply: County Councillor Goodway

The Community Asset Transfer of Pentrebane Community Centre has been delayed pending the review of the Council's Community Asset

453

454

Transfer Strategy, which was approved by the Cabinet yesterday afternoon.

I am advised that Communities First have been using the centre, but that the arrangement is due to expire in March. However, they may wish to renew the current agreement in order to keep the building open until the outcome of the asset transfer process is known.

<u>Supplementary Question</u>: County Councillor McEvoy

I would like the Councillor's guarantee that wider politics will not play a role in any decision because we have a community centre in Pentrebane, some very able local people who are not party political. You know, some people in this room say that they are, but they are not, I wish they were actually, they are just lovely, lovely people who want to do the best for their community, and it's wrong for anyone to politicise community action like that and I just hope that it's not going to happen.

Reply:County Councillor Goodway

Councillor McEvoy continues to speak in the Chamber in code and it is very difficult for me to decipher precisely what he means but the process of Community Asset Transfer is set out in the strategy and the Council will at all times adhere to it.

ENVIROMENT QUESTION

Question:

County Councillor Ali

As an animal lover and animal welfare campaigner, I would like to thank this Council for supporting my member's debate last year on 'irresponsible dog ownership and dog fouling'. Can you confirm that the dog mess off the streets in a 24 hours rapid response scheme is ward based or all across the city?

Reply:

County Councillor Govier

I can confirm that it is all wards across the city I think, but I think what will begin to frustrate residents probably is how Cllr Kelloway raised the issue of if they see it in parks, land that seems like it is on the highway but in essence it is housing land, it is an issue that I am determined to

address this year in terms of removing those barriers as phase 2 of Cardiff Outdoors but it is across all wards, at the moment highway land but I am looking to address that issue.

Supplementary Question: County Councillor Dilwar Ali

Can you confirm if there is any plan for out of hours reporting hotline numbers?

Reply:

County Councillor Govier

Out of hours, I do not think we will have the budget for that, I wish we did and I would like to say that I would get back to you in writing but I wouldn't waste your time or mine. I am not quite sure we will have the budget for that but a 24 hour service will mean that somewhere in that 24 it will be in hours and we will get to it.

EDUCATION AND LIFELONG LEARNING QUESTION

Question:

County Councillor Love

What level of involvement of children and young people is there to help decide how pupil deprivation grants in school are spent and monitored?

<u>Reply:</u> *County Councillor Magill*

You will be aware that, in Cardiff, our schools benefit from just under £4 million of Pupil Deprivation Grant, which is due to double in the 2014/2015 financial year as a result of decisions made by Welsh Government which is extremely welcome.

The Leader has actually had very recent communication from the Minister which has been sent to all Leaders in Wales reminding them that the use of the Pupil Deprivation Grant is not a free for all, that it is for very specific purposes and the Minister is seeking assurances that the grant is being used appropriately along Welsh Government guidelines, so in terms of involving young people there are limits within which that would have to be done, it would have to be done very carefully not to raise their expectations that it which could be applied in ways that are not possible in terms of the grant.

456

Nonetheless, we have asked colleagues in the Central South Consortium to identify any examples of schools where they have identified good practices in this regard and I will write to you and let you know when they get back to me on that.

Supplementary Question: County Councillor Love

It is great to hear that the support for Pupil Deprivation Grant is being doubled by the Welsh Government, so thank you for confirming that. I understand in relation to your response that there are going to limitations in terms of how this money can be spent and I would just ask if we could consider how the existing network of school councils which I think are very successful forums and opportunities for children and young people in schools to contribute to influencing or even contributing as to how this particular grant from Welsh Government is spent.

Reply: County Councillor Magill

Obviously it is a matter for schools themselves to work with their school councils and as I say I think it will be interesting when we get a response back from South Central Consortium to see if there are examples of good practice which we can promulgate through the schools.

Supplementary Question: County Councillor Carter

It is great to see in the spirit of collaboration, it is great to see two Labour Councillors actively praising a Lib Dem inspired premium brought in in the last budget negotiations at a Welsh level. I was wondering Councillor Magill whether you could assure me of what policing, if any, the council will be able to do of schools to ensure that certain schools don't sneakily use this money to subsidise other services rather than it being funnelled to the most vulnerable. I note your response about the guidance coming from Welsh Government I wonder what resources, if any, we have to police that on a monthly/annual basis.

Reply: County Councillor Magill

Schools are required to actually make plans against the Pupil Deprivation Grant and report on it and that is the information we will be drawing on

457

to assure ourselves within Cardiff that the money is being spent appropriately.

SPORT, LEISURE AND CULTURE QUESTION

Question: County Councillor Bradbury

What medical equipment is supplied to Council Park Attendants to help save lives in our sporting parks?

Reply: County Councillor Patel

Games Attendants at manned sites are provided with basic first aid kits and the Games Attendants will assist with first aid as required but they are not supplied with or trained to use lifesaving equipment such as defibrillators and in the event of a serious incident staff seek assistance from the emergency services.

Supplementary Question: County Councillor Bradbury

I would like to beg your indulgence as second LM as I would like to publicly express my sympathies to the family of Vincent Francis, a constituent of mine, who sadly died playing for his beloved Caerau Rugby Vets in a charity rugby game at Trelai Park. We will never know, in fact I am pretty convinced that if a defibrillator would have saved his life however, surely Councillor Patel the purchase of a defibrillator and training council staff or any staff to use it. If it were to save one life it would be a purchase worth making could you have a look at this? I know it will not be possible in this budget round, but in future budget rounds because this is not the first occasion that somebody unfortunately has died whilst taking part in sport in our parks, and I would really appreciate it if we could look at this issue urgently, as urgently as possible because it is a serious issue.

Reply:

County Councillor Patel

I totally agree it is a serious issue; no lives should ever be lost in any form especially in sport. If there is any possibility of saving these lives it is extremely import. I will need to check with the officers regarding this and also I am aware that someone to be trained to his level has to be quite highly trained. A perfect example of this was when Councillor Ralph

458

Cook fell ill, there was the three of us in that room we did not have the skills. If we had done anything differently he could have possibly, serious consequences could have happened so I think the level of training has to be extremely high and I will certainly explore those options.

Supplementary Question: County Councillor Sanders

Just following up that comment about automatic defibrillators I want to underline again the request that you look at it again. In my experience you don't have to be highly trained when you use an automatic defibrillator but my question really is about that training that whenever you are looking at a package of equipment can you also ensure that the training, be it however minor in effect, that the training could be, is put together with that medical equipment because again, in my experience, having equipment with no training is almost worse than not having the equipment at all.

Reply:

County Councillor Patel

I will certainly do that and I will answer the questions you have asked by a written email or a letter.

Supplementary Question: County Councillor Woodman

It is not a question I am trying to provide some useful information to this Council, there is a charity called Welsh Hearts which are currently engaged in providing defibrillators right across Wales, the charity pays for it, and the charity also provides the training. They recently launched this at the stadium in the city centre so I would strongly recommend that the Council links in with that because here is an ideal opportunity to gain something to save lives which will not cost this Council money.

<u>Reply</u> :	County Councillor Patel

Once again, I will ask the Officers to make contact with this organisation.

459

ENVIRONMENT QUESTION

Question:

County Councillor Gordon

Last month you gave a breakdown of the street cleansing rota in Lisvane in answer to Cllr Walker's question, and I would like to know the new rota for Riverside, following the priority area pilot which has ended. Please could this information re: the number of times that shop frontage pavements, gutters, streets, and pavements are swept – and how – be tabulated and circulated to us all so we know what is currently due to be done in our wards and compare to other areas?

This would be in a similar way to which members get information ward by ward on how many parking fines have been levied.

Reply:

County Councillor Govier

The complete rota breakdown was on the December Cabinet Report and what I will do I think is I will ask officials to send out again the rota to all Councillors because I think it is important that all Councillors are fullyaware of when the cleansing teams are going to be in their wards and what they are expected to do. We can do all the monitoring through technical data and analysis and so on that we currently do but I also think that it is key that Councillors can also hold me to account on how well the teams are performing in the wards so if it okay with you I will get an email issued to Councillors tomorrow, is that ok?

Supplementary Question: County Councillor Gordon

Is Riverside still a priority area or not?

Reply: County Councillor Govier

Riverside will always be a priority area Councillor Gordon.

ENVIRONMENT QUESTION

Question:

County Councillor Richard Cook

What progress has been made in making sure that all premises in Cardiff that serve or sell food comply with the new Welsh Government legislation that requires them to display their food hygiene rating?

Reply:

County Councillor Govier

I think we have made some good progress, there are some 3000 food businesses in the city and what this piece of legislation has required is that we take the score, because all those businesses have been scored by about 200 which is the turnover, the score historically has been placed on a website, the Food Standards Agency website, you can go on to that site now and still see now what all the scores are for our outlets what this has required though is that they take them from the website and put them on the doors, scores on the doors at the moment we have done about 200 businesses, we have got about 18 months to try and get around the rest of the businesses and we are prioritising the high risk ones first so yes, good progress is being made.

<u>Supplementary Question:</u> County Councillor Richard Cook

Thank you for that response, I think there is probably a correlation between a premises getting a zero or a 1 score and how well that premises is managed and therefore how well the waste in that premises is managed as well, so this is what I am concerned about. I wonder whether you could ask Officers perhaps if they just walked up and down Cowbridge Road East, in Canton and Riverside, and perhaps Albany Road in Cathays and Plasnewydd and those areas where there are far too many, in my opinion, A3 takeaways and restaurants and just a quick visit to each one to see whether they have got the score on the door because I think that would encourage people to visit them or not to visit them, it may affect their business and may get them to pull their socks up and deal with their waste and hygiene efficiently as well.

Reply:County Councillor Govier

I understand your visual concerns, but I think with this I am cautious about giving direction as to where the team should focus, there is a

guidance that they follow in terms of what the high risk premises, there are many things that make up a high risk premises, it is not just the location, it could be on terms of what kind of food they serve, what kind of people use the restaurant, numbers that use the restaurant, it's quite a complex matrix that is used but they are going to the high risk premises, I can get you the information of the high risk premises' that we are looking at in the city at the moment, it does come on the performance indicator reports so I am probably minded, at the moment, to let them continue going through current rota that they are working on I think they are doing a good job on that at the moment.

Supplementary Question: County Councillor Hudson

Can you also emphasise that the hygiene ratings should be prominently displayed because in our area they are not very obvious.

Reply: County Councillor Govier

The scores on the doors they need to be prominently displayed, I am not sure of the exact ruling, I will have to check that and if you have any evidence or you can send me where these stores/shops are or the outlets are I can ask officials to look into that for you.

QUESTION TO THE LEADER

Question:

County Councillor Evans

What progress is being made in respect of the establishment of a Welsh Language Working Group and the development of a Welsh language strategy?

Reply:	County	Councillor	Inver
<u>Kepiy</u> .	County	Councillor	JUYCE

Party Group Whips have been asked to put forward nominations for the new Welsh Language Working Group and a report is due to be considered later on today's Council agenda, which will include nominations to this Working Group. Draft Terms of Reference have also been prepared and are appended to the report.

In terms of the revised Welsh Language Skills Strategy, this is essentially a workforce planning document, which ensures that we will, over a period

462

of time, have the capacity and skills to deliver all frontline services bilingually.

The revised strategy was issued for consultation at the beginning of January and is expected to be considered by the Cabinet in due course. Subject to approval, it is envisaged that the implementation of the revised strategy's timetable will begin in April this year.

<u>Supplementary Question</u>: County Councillor Evans

Given the need to develop an effective Welsh Language strategy across the area I think you have mentioned, but also others areas as well, Education, Culture, Business, Economic Development and so forth. Can you confirm that the Welsh Language Working Group will engage proactively with representatives from the Welsh speaking community in developing that strategy and secondly, can this working group have a role in ensuring that it can assist us in making sure that public money is spent effectively at this difficult time and also help us ensure that any savings or cuts will not impact disproportionally on the Welsh speaking community.

Reply:

County Councillor Joyce

Quite a lot of things you want me to confirm. What I can confirm is that when the Welsh Language conference takes place in March, these are all things that can be discussed and taken forward.

Supplementary Question: County Councillor McEvoy

Could the Leader tell us what the terms of reference will be of the working group?

Reply: County Councillor Joyce

They have been published and shared with the Whips, it is on the agenda. It will be coming up on Agenda Item 15.

463

ENVIRONMENT QUESTION

Question:

County Councillor Dilwar Ali

It is a great initiative by Cardiff Council to help people switching to cheaper energy with CYD Cymru. Can you confirm how many people have registered to switch energy suppliers with CYD Cymru?

Reply:

County Councillor Govier

It was a fairly ambitious scheme that we embarked on with CYD Cymru, in particular, where Wales has the lowest percentage of switchers in the UK, currently registered as 5300 people, in the first round 5300 people registered and we estimated we could have saved them a combined total of a million pounds. So far 700 people have switched and saved a combined total of £130,000. So it seems that it has borne the fruit that we were looking for, we have learned some lessons for the first switching round to take into the second switching one but I am hopeful we can continue this going forward.

Supplementary Question: County Councillor Dilwar Ali

It was a great response but I want to know when the second stage for CYD Cymru will open and how long for?

Reply:

County Councillor Govier

I am really really keen to try to get a unique collective tariff to do that we need 25,000 so what I have asked Officials to do at the moment is look wider than Wales, because we tried to do Wales, keep with Wales, but also look to some of the authorities in England and potentially Scotland and can we all join together in a collective switch and really hype up the bargaining power so that is what we are trying to do for the second switch and we will be looking to go live with that, I am hopeful within the next two weeks but I think if we can pull together more than just the Welsh authorities then we have a real chance of taking the fight to some of these energy companies.

<u>Supplementary Question</u>: County Councillor Bowden

I have registered and certainly made savings over the following 12 months I hope and I have publicised it a lot in my Ward. However, I have received complaints that this is nothing more than a price comparison site at the moment so can you just explain for me in this leaflet what the energy auction is and how residents are actually buying energy together at the moment?

Reply:

County Councillor Govier

The whole point of collective energy bargaining was to take a group to the market that we could get a reverse auction. There was a legislative change in December which meant the energy companies had to remove some of the complex tariffs and actually come up with a unique collective tariff. So that is what the energy companies are currently doing, it is publicised to the wider public as well as to the collective, so what we were trying to do here was to address the issue of Wales having the lowest number of switchers in the UK so to try and get people out of the individual mentality and try and bring them into a collective responsibility to switch. Taking 700 to switch in, I think has proved that and you may have had some complaints but I assure you I have had lots of testimonials on the other side to say how people have saved money. I am keen though to try and get that collective tariff switch so what we have to keep doing is promoting this, reach that magic 25,000 number and then we can really begin to take that challenge on. This was the first one and I am really pleased to save £130,000 combined total for residents, the next round let us be more ambitious and let's try and get 25,000 for the collective switch.

150 : CONSTITUTION COMMITTEE – 22 JANUARY 2014

Council received a report setting out the recommendations of the Council's Constitution Committee relating to amendments to:

- (a) Budget Procedure Rules;
- (b) Members' Access to Information Rules; and
- (c) Employment Procedure Rules.

RESOLVED - That the following amendments to the procedure rules as recommended by the Constitution Committee be approved.

(1) <u>Budget Procedure Rules</u>

That reference to the "Council's Corporate Asset Management Plan" be removed from Rule 4 of the Budget Procedure Rules;

(2) Access to Information Rules

The Access to Information Rules be amended as set out in Annex B attached to the report;

(3) Employment Procedure Rules/Delegations

The changes to:

- The Employment Procedure Rules, as set out in Annex C; and
- The Scheme of Delegations, Appointments Committee Terms of Reference and HR Officer Delegations as set out in Annex D.

151 : APPOINTMENT OF LOCAL AUTHORITY GOVERNORS TO SCHOOL GOVERNING BODIES

The Council was recommended to approve the appointment of Local Authority School Governors as listed in the report.

RESOLVED - That the following appointments of School Governors be approved: -

<u>School</u>	<u>Ward</u>	Start of	Applications
Willows High (2 vacancies)	Splott	<u>Vacancy</u> 24/04/2013	Councillor E Stubbs
Bryn Hafod Primary	Llanrumney	10/10/2013	Miss A Aviet
Creigiau Primary (2 vacancies)	Creigiau	03/10/2012	Mrs J Horton
Meadowlane Primary (2 vacancies)	Trowbridge	04/01/2012 02/10/2012	Mr M E Willmore

466

Pentrebane Primary	Fairwater	20/01/2013	Mr P J Murphy
Trowbridge Primary	Trowbridge	01/01/2014	Mr I McDonald
Willowbrook Primary (2 vacancies)	Trowbridge	31/05/12 27/06/2012	Miss N J Jakomis
Ysgol Gymraeg Coed- y-Gof	Fairwater	27/02/2013	Ms A L Davies
Tremorfa Nursery	Splott	09/11/2012	Mrs R E Probert
Adamsdown Primary	Adamsdown	26/03/2014	Councillor N Howells (Renomination)
Coed Glas Primary	Llanishen	10/01/2014	Mrs M Withecombe
Lakeside Primary	Cyncoed	23/02/2014	Mrs M Rawle (Renomination)
St Cuthbert's RC Primary	Butetown	26/02/2014	Mr J E Coates (Renomination)
Ely and Caerau Children's Centre	Ely	26/03/2014	Mrs S Dredge
Ty Gwyn	Caerau	23/02/2014	Miss T Windels

152 : NOTICE OF MOTION

The Lord Mayor advised there had been 2 Notices of Motion for consideration at this meeting however Notice of Motion 2 had been formally withdrawn.

The following Notice of Motion was moved by Councillor McEvoy and seconded by Councillor Ford:

This Council notes the increase in demand for Welsh Medium Education in Cardiff.

We call upon the Cabinet to open a new Welsh Medium Primary School within the boundary of the Grangetown or Butetown Wards.

The following amendment was proposed by Councillor Magill and seconded by Councillor Gordon:

Delete the whole of paragraph 2 and substitute the following wording:

Council is asked to note that the Cabinet is committed to providing Welsh Medium Education and is planning to consider proposals to meet demand in the Butetown, Canton, Grangetown and Riverside areas of Cardiff at its meeting in March 2014.

The Substantive Motion would read:

This Council notes the increase in demand for Welsh Medium Education in Cardiff.

Council is asked to note that the Cabinet is committed to providing Welsh Medium education and is planning to consider proposals to meet demand in the Butetown, Canton, Grangetown and Riverside areas of Cardiff at its meeting in March 2014.

Following a debate a vote was taken on the amendment as proposed.

The amendment was carried.

A vote was taken on the Substantive Notice of Motion as agreed. The Motion was carried.

153 : URGENT BUSINESS

In accordance with the pilot Council Procedure Rule 3 (xv) the Lord Mayor advised that he had not been notified of any urgent matters for this meeting.

154 : APPOINTMENT OF CHAIR AND NOMINATIONS TO COUNCIL COMMITTEES AND PANELS

The Council at its Annual Meeting on 23 May 2013 elected the Chairs and Deputy Chairs (where appropriate) of Committees established by the Council and received and approved nominations from political groups to the seats allocated on each Committee. Subsequent changes to the Committee Membership have been reported to Full Council at its meetings on 27 June 2013, 25 July 2013, 26 September 2014 and 25 October 2014.

The Council received nominations to the vacant Chair of the Employment Conditions Committee and vacancies on Committees.

RESOLVED – That

(1) The following nominations to vacancies on Committees be noted.

Committee Membership

Constitution Committee	Councillor Richard Cook		
Democratic Services Committee:	one vacancy		
Employment Conditions Committee	Councillor Michael Michael		
Community & Adult Scrutiny Committee:	one vacancy		
Corporate Parenting Panel	one vacancy		
Health & Safety Advisory Committee	two vacancies		
Works Council	Councillor Ralph Cook		

- (2) Councillor Michael Michael be elected as Chair of the Employment Conditions Committee;
- (3) The terms of reference for the Welsh Language Working Group and the following nominations to sit on this Group be noted:

Welsh Language Working Group

Councillor Huw Thomas (Chair) Councillor Dilwar Ali Councillor Phil Bale Councillor Jonathan Evans Councillor Russell Goodway

469

Councillor Sue Lent Councillor Nigel Howells Councillor Adrian Robson Councillor Neil McEvoy One vacancy

155 : NOMINATION OF MEMBERS TO SERVE ON OUTSIDE BODIES

The Constitution provides that the Council will, from time to time, receive nominations and make Member appointments as necessary to serve as representatives of the Council on outside bodies.

RESOLVED – That

(1) South East Wales Transport Alliance (SEWTA)

That the nomination of Councillor Graham Hinchey, Cabinet Member for Strategic Planning and Transport be approved;

(2) <u>Cardiff and Vale of Glamorgan Community Health Council</u> No further nominations had been received to fill this position, therefore one vacancy remains outstanding.

(Formal Meeting closed at 20.33pm)

In accordance with pilot Council Procedure Rule 17 (f) the following Written Questions were received for considerations and response ahead of this meeting. A full copy of all written questions together with the answers were circulated to Members by email and published on the website in advance of the Council meeting and are included as a record in the minutes of the meeting.

WRITTEN QUESTIONS

<u>COMMUNITIES, HOUSING AND NEIGHBOURHOOD RENEWAL –</u> <u>WRITTEN QUESTIONS: COUNCIL, 30 JANUARY 2014</u>

W1	WRITTEN QUESTION FROM COUNTY COUNCILLOR BRIDGES
	For many months now, Cardiff residents have been unable to buy/renew parking permits at County Hall. There is also – still – no online application process available. Cllr. Lynda Thorne has previously indicated issuing/renewal of parking permits will be a facility of a Central Advice Hub. Please can she say when this will happen, and how it will be advertised?
	<u>Reply</u>
	I am advised that the Council's ICT team is currently working to deliver an online solution by a target date of April 2014. Public access to an online facility via the Council's website is expected to see a large transfer of future applications to this new method. Once operational, the new online facility will also be advertised widely, including in the Capital Times newspaper, which is delivered to all households in Cardiff.
	For those applicants who have no computer access or who are not confident in using such online facilities, general assistance to use the online parking permit service will be available through the Hubs. Visitors to County Hall can also deposit their applications in the secure post box located there and such applications are processed daily.
W2	WRITTEN QUESTION FROM COUNTY COUNCILLOR DE'ATH
	The definition of a 'local connection' used by Cardiff Council includes people who work in the city but reside elsewhere. What efforts are being

made to work with other local authorities on a reciprocal basis to tackle issues that arise from this?

<u>Reply</u>

The definition of a 'local connection' is set in the Housing Act 1996, which states that:

"A person has a local connection with the district of a local housing authority if he has a connection with it

- (a) because he is, or in the past was, normally resident there, and that residence is or was of his own choice,
- (b) because he is employed there,
- (c) because of family associations, or
- (d) because of special circumstances."

Local authorities are bound by this legislation and, if they choose to offer additional preference for housing to applicants with a local connection to their area, must include not only people who live there, but also those who work in the area.

In terms of applying this definition, local connection is of relevance to the Authority's consideration of homelessness cases and also for general applications to join the housing waiting list.

If an applicant is eligible for assistance under homelessness legislation, is unintentionally homeless (or threatened with homelessness) and in priority need of accommodation, the local authority can, and generally will, consider whether or not they have a local connection with their area. Where the applicant has a local connection with Cardiff, we would normally have the housing duty.

If it is decided that an applicant has no local connection with Cardiff, but has a connection in another local authority, then a local connection referral would be made to that area. The Authority's duties with regard to such referrals are mainly covered in s198 of the Housing Act 1996.

There is no specific Council policy (or reciprocal arrangements) in place regarding local connection referrals. The Council is governed by legislation and case law when referring an applicant to another area or accepting an applicant referred from another area.

	All local authorities are required under legislation to consider applications for housing from anyone, whether or not they live or work in the area.			
	The Council's properties are currently allocated under the Allocations Policy that was approved in November 2010. Under this policy, 200 points are awarded to applicants with a local connection to the city to ensure that they are given a higher priority for rehousing than those in similar circumstances who have no local connection.			
	There are no formal arrangements in place with other local authorities to address any issues arising from local connection arrangements relating to general applications. However, a new Allocation Scheme was approved by the Cabinet in December 2013, which aims to ensure that housing need and local connection are recognised, but that all applicants are given realistic and constructive advice about the likelihood of being rehoused in the city within a reasonable timeframe. Applicants with no local connection to the city would now be advised that they could only join one of the lower waiting list bands and would therefore only be made an offer of accommodation if there were no applicants in a higher band for whom the property was suitable. Applicants who are working in the city but who are adequately housed elsewhere would fall within the lowest band and would be advised that their chances of being rehoused would be limited. They would be offered advice about renting privately or approaching the local authority where they live in order to enquire about social housing in that area.			
W3	V3 WRITTEN QUESTION FROM COUNTY COUNCILLOR DE'ATH			
115				DEAII
	What was the percentage breakdown of respondents by ward following the public consultation on the future of Splott/STAR leisure provision?			
	<u>Reply</u>			
	The percentage of respondents to the Splott Community Hub consultation by ward is set out in the table below:			
		Number	%	
	Adamsdown	112	12.0	
	Butetown	8	0.9	
	Canton	7	0.7	

	Cathays	7	0.7	
	Cyncoed	8	0.9	
	Grangetown	8	0.9	
	Heath	9	1.0	
	Llandaff	6	0.6	
	Llanishen	12	1.3	
	Llanrumney	10	1.1	
	Pentwyn	16	1.7	
	Penylan	32	3.4	
	Plasnewydd	33	3.5	
	Pontprennau / Old St Mellons	5	0.5	
	Radyr & Morganstown	5	0.5	
	Rhiwbina	12	1.3	
	Riverside	7	0.7	
	Rumney	16	1.7	
	Splott	445	47.5	
	Trowbridge	21	2.2	
	Whitchurch & Tongwynlais	14	1.5	
	Other*	15	1.6	
	Not stated	129	13.8	
	Total	937	100.0	
W4	*Wards with less than 5 responde category (these are from Caerau, Gabalfa, Llandaff North and Pentyrch WRITTEN QUESTION FROM CO	Creigiau/St 2).	Fagans, El	y, Fairwater,
	What percentage of respondents from should be built on the site currently of facilities in Splott Park, and that serv the new site' in the hub consultation?	occupied by S	Splott Pool	and adjoining
	Reply			
	In the Splott Community Hub const identified as living in Plasnewydd, of locate the new hub at the Splott Pa	whom 11 ag	reed with th	e proposal to

474	1
-----	---

	Agree	e	Disagr	ee	No opir	nion	Tota	al
	Number	%	Number	%	Number	%	Number	%
	11	33.3	15	45.5	7	21.2	33	100.0
W5	WRITTEN	QUES	TION FRO	Μ COI	JNTY COL	J NCILI	LOR DE'A	<u>TH</u>
	What evaluated facilities that Roath) area f	t could	d serve the	STAR	(Splott, Tre			•
	<u>Reply</u>							
	As part of the options appraisal for the Splott Community Hub, an evaluation of travel times from different parts of the STAR Centre area was undertaken. The maximum extra travel distance to the proposed Hub location at Splott Park, compared with the existing STAR Centre, is 675 metres. This equates to a 10 minutes walk or 5 minutes drive time. The proposed Hub location is also on the main bus route through Splott.					ea was 1 Hub is 675		
W6	WRITTEN	QUES	TION FRO	M COU	JNTY COU	J NCILI	LOR McEV	VOY
	When was fu	inding	approved for	the up	grade of Car	nton lib	rary?	
	<u>Reply</u>							
	Capital allocations of £750,000 were approved for library investment improvements to Canton and Radyr as part of the 2011/12 Capital Programme, which was approved by Council on 24 February 2011. Additional grant monies for furniture and fit out for Canton library were sought from CyMAL in 2011/12, 2012/13 and 2013/14, with the library service being successful finally in securing this grant funding in 2013/14. A grant of £120,000 was awarded by CyMAL on 27 March 2013.							
					library			
W7	WRITTEN	QUES	TION FRO	Μ COU	JNTY COL	J NCILI	LOR McEV	<u>OY</u>
	When will Tenant's Fed			ent's A	ssociation	be allo	owed to join	in the

Reply

Pentrebane Residents Association is able to become a member of the Cardiff Tenants and Residents Federation by completing an application form and meeting the Council's recognition criteria, as set out below:

Tenants and Residents Associations – Recognition Criteria

In order to be recognised by the Council and Cardiff Tenants and Residents Federation, Tenants and Residents Associations need to:

- 1. Adopt a constitution (Items 1 8) additions to meet the individual needs of Associations are acceptable) which has been approved by the Council and Cardiff Tenants and Residents Federation
- 2. Hold an Annual General Meeting within a maximum of each 13 month period to elect Officers (and maintain an original signed AGM Attendance List)
- 3. Hold Committee and open General Meetings regularly
- 4. Keep open minutes or records of all meetings (AGM minutes/records must be supplied to the Council and Cardiff Tenants and Residents Federation on a yearly basis to continue with their recognised status)
- 5. Keep a record of accounts showing income and expenditure (copy and breakdown of annual accounts to be supplied to the Council and Cardiff Tenants and Residents Federation)
- 6. Act in accordance with Equal Opportunities and Practice guidelines
- 7. Act in accordance with an agreed Code of Conduct
- 8. Operate in accordance with the constitution
- 9. Act in a responsible, open, accountable and democratic manner
- 10. Operate within a geographical area that must include Local Authority Housing

4	7	6
---	---	---

	monthly Fe	on at least o	ne occasion, ting of all A	in a six month ssociations, un	TRA must be n period, at the less reasonable	
	Once these criteria passed on to the Fe					
	To date, the Cou information from Council's Commu available to meet w this process, if requ	Pentrebane I nities, Housi vith the Assoc	Residents As ng & Custor	sociation. Offi mer Services	icers from the directorate are	
W8	WRITTEN QUES	TION FROM	I COUNTY	COUNCILLO	R McEVOY	
	<u>Reply</u> From 3 rd May 2012 to 23 rd January 2014, a total of 80 properties of all types have been let in the Fairwater area. These are broken down by year and property size in the following table:					
	have been let in the	ne Fairwater	area. These a		• 1	
	have been let in the	ne Fairwater	area. These a le:		• 1	
	have been let in the	ne Fairwater	area. These a le:	re broken dow	• 1	
	have been let in the property size in the	he Fairwater following tab	area. These a le: Numbe	re broken dow r of Lets 2014 (<i>to</i>	vn by year and	
	have been let in the property size in the Property Size	he Fairwater following tab	area. These a de: Numbe 2013	r of Lets 2014 (<i>to</i> 23/01/14)	TOTAL	
	have been let in the property size in the Property Size Bedsit	he Fairwater following tab 2012 1	area. These a ale: <u>Numbe</u> 2013 2	r of Lets 2014 (to 23/01/14) 0	TOTAL	
	have been let in the property size in the Property Size Bedsit One Bed	he Fairwater following tab	area. These a de: Numbe 2013	r of Lets 2014 (to 23/01/14) 0 3	TOTAL	
	have been let in the property size in the Property Size Bedsit	he Fairwater following tab 2012 1 18	area. These a le: Numbe 2013 2 29	r of Lets 2014 (to 23/01/14) 0	TOTAL 3 50	
	have been let in the property size in the Property Size Bedsit One Bed Two Bed	he Fairwater following tab 2012 1 18 3	area. These a le: Numbe 2013 2 29 7	er of Lets 2014 (to 23/01/14) 0 3 2	TOTAL 3 50 12	

Re	pl <u>y</u>
and as o ide	tnerships and Communities Together (PACT) meetings are organised I managed by the Neighbourhood Policing Teams of South Wales Police one of their engagement mechanisms for interacting with communities to ntify issues which matter most. They are usually held in each ward on a nthly basis.
whi Sou 201 are	e of the recommendations in the 'Building Communities' White Paper, ich were agreed by the Cabinet in October last year, was to <i>"undertake a</i> <i>uth Wales Police review of the effectiveness of PACT meetings"</i> by March 4. I can confirm that discussions with the Police & Crime Commissioner ongoing in relation to this proposed review and how it relates to the ghbourhood partnership arrangements.
W10 WI	RITTEN QUESTION FROM COUNTY COUNCILLOR MCEVOY
On a. b. c. d. d. e. f. g. h. i. j. k. l. m.	 the data held on the ASBIT database up to 30 November 2013: How many individual victims are recorded? How many individual offenders are recorded? How many incidents are recorded? Of those incidents: i. How many have resulted in a person being charged by the police? ii. Of those, how many of those cases have concluded? iii. Of those, how many have resulted in an entry on the National Police Computer (i.e. caution, conviction, reprimand, or formal warning?) How many victims have had their data disclosed to third parties? Of those, how many gave their informed consent for each transfer? How many non-victims have had their data disclosed to third parties? Of those, how many gave their informed consent? What money or other services have been provided directly or indirectly in exchange for data transfers or disclosures to third parties? How do people find out whether or not their details are recorded on the database?

	Reply
	I am unable to provide this information as the database is not used by the Council due to the strict vetting procedures that are required by South Wales Police, who are also responsible for the administration of the database and the information held on it. I would therefore suggest that you direct your enquiries to them.
W11	WRITTEN QUESTION FROM COUNTY COUNCILLOR McEVOY
	Please list all the persons who can access the information in the ASB database, whether directly or communicated to them by those who already have access.
	Where these persons are legal persons (public, or private such as including charities and unincorporated associations and businesses and the ACPO group of companies and other constabularies not holding the data in the course of their duties), list all of the directors agents or employees of that body who can access the information.
	<u>Reply</u>
	I would refer you to the answer provided above to your earlier Written Question on this subject.
W12	WRITTEN QUESTION FROM COUNTY COUNCILLOR
	WOODMAN
	Could the Cabinet member advise how many council housing tenants in Cardiff have been wrongly advised that the under occupancy rule applies to them, when in fact they are exempt due to living in the property continuously since January 1996 and have been in continuous receipt of housing benefit?
	How much money has had to be refunded to tenants because of this, please and how many residents were placed in arrears due to this error?
	<u>Reply</u>
	The loophole in the Housing Benefit regulations which allows this exemption is very complex and several different criteria need to apply for

the tenant to be exempt from the rules.

Currently, 162 council housing tenants have been identified where the exemption applies. This is a very time-intensive exercise and officers are still working through records to identify further cases.

To date, £104,777.63 in additional Housing Benefit has been awarded to council tenants as a result of this exemption and, if Housing Association tenants are included, the total amount which has been awarded overall is $\pounds161,324.06$.

55 of the 162 council tenants were in receipt of discretionary housing payments to cover the under occupancy costs. Therefore, the remaining 107 would potentially have been placed in arrears if they did not pay the shortfall.

The UK Government has made clear that it will be introducing legislation to close the loophole as soon as possible. This is expected to take place in early March 2014 and all the claims will then need to be amended again in order to re-apply the deduction.

DEPUTY LEADER – WRITTEN QUESTIONS: COUNCIL, 30 JANUARY 2014

W13 WRITTEN QUESTION FROM COUNTY COUNCILLOR DE'ATH

The assessment by the Department for Work and Pensions of its own mandatory work activity programme found it has no impact on the likelihood of participants gaining employment and showed them as likely to claim benefits over the long term as those not on the scheme. The study was peer-reviewed by the National Institute of Economic and Social Research who called the scheme "a complete policy disaster". Does Cardiff Council provide unpaid mandatory work placements as part of the UK Government's Work Programme?

Reply

Previously, the Future Jobs Fund (FJF) project provided a mandatory work placement element of the previous Labour Government's Future Jobs Fund Scheme This involved Cardiff Council co-ordinating the placing of over 600 participants on 6-month placements. The last placements under this scheme were received and placed in March 2011 and left in September 2011. Cardiff Council is not involved in centrally co-ordinating mandatory unpaid work placements as part of the UK Government's Work Programme.

Unconnected to the Government's Work Programme, the Council does however provide a range of unpaid work placement opportunities for citizens through a variety of mechanisms including: dedicated Careers Wales Work Experience Placements; practical work placements for Further and Higher Education students. Cardiff Council also provides a range of paid work placement experience including opportunities for Trade Apprenticeships, Job Growth Wales placements, and Go Wales placements for graduate and post graduates.

As you will be aware, on 7 November 2013, the Cabinet approved proposals for all placement opportunities to be provided through a new structured corporate framework with central coordination, monitoring and support for all work placements programmes.

W14	WRITTEN QUESTION FROM COUNTY COUNCILLOR DE'ATH
** 17	
	How many jobseekers have taken part in mandatory work activity at Cardiff

	Council since 2011?
	Reply
	From April 2010 to March 2011, 436 placements relating to the former Future Jobs Fund scheme were supported by Cardiff Council. The last placements under this scheme were received and placed in March 2011 and left after completing their mandatory work experience element in September 2011.
	However, since the end of the Future Jobs Fund in 2011, the information you are seeking is not held by the Council. Where job seekers are accessing work activity, the expectation is that partners such as Job Centre Plus would hold this information.
W15	WRITTEN QUESTION FROM COUNTY COUNCILLOR DE'ATH
	Is the authority aware of any jobseekers having their benefits sanctioned for issues connected with a mandatory work placement at this authority?
	<u>Reply</u>
	The Council would not have access to information that would identify whether jobseekers have had any benefits sanctioned for any issues connected with a mandatory unpaid work placement.
W16	WRITTEN QUESTION FROM COUNTY COUNCILLOR DE'ATH
	How many jobseekers have been offered permanent employment after completing unpaid work activity placements at Cardiff Council?
	<u>Reply</u>
	This information is not currently recorded on the Council's systems.
W17	WRITTEN QUESTION FROM COUNTY COUNCILLOR McEVOY
	How many staff who receive the living wage have seen cuts in hours or worked less hours since the living wage was introduced?
	What is the average cut in gross pay per person if less hours worked?

<u>Reply</u>

You will be aware that Cardiff was the first Council in Wales to make a commitment to introduce the Living Wage for its lowest paid employees who do some of the most important and challenging jobs in the Council and so should be paid a decent salary for the work they do.

We signalled our intention to implement the Living Wage in a report to Cabinet in July 2012 and implemented it from September 2012. Approximately 2,000 council staff are currently in receipt of the Living Wage.

As advised when you asked a Written Question back in October last year about reductions in working hours, it is important to have some context. A reduction in hours can be at the request of an individual for personal reasons or as part of a request for Flexible Retirement, but also for service delivery needs (e.g. as part of a reconfiguration of services to support budget savings).

Since September 2012, 75 Living Wage staff have seen a reduction in their working hours (a total of minus 348 hours); however, 51 Living Wage staff have seen an increase in their hours (a total increase of 309 hours). Therefore, there has been an overall reduction of 39 hours, split between 2,000 staff, which equates to an average reduction of \pounds 7.50 per person per annum.

EDUCATION AND LIFELONG LEARNING – WRITTEN QUESTIONS: COUNCIL, 30 JANUARY 2014

W18 WRITTEN QUESTION FROM COUNTY COUNCILLOR McEVOY

Can you please list the number of Year 7 pupils in Cantonian and Fitzalan and list the primary schools they came from?

Reply

There are currently 279 pupils in the Year 7 age group at Fitzalan High School who attended the following primary schools:

Primary School	No. of Pupils
Adamsdown	3
Allensbank	2
Grangetown	34
Herbert Thompson	3
Kitchener	38
Lansdowne	41
Moorland	1
Mount Stuart	35
Ninian Park	36
Pencaerau	1
Radnor	5
St Alban's	1
St Mary's	14
St Paul's	7
Severn	31
Springwood	1
Stacey	1
Primary school not within Cardiff	20
Educated Abroad	5
TOTAL =	279

There are currently 64 pupils in the Year 7 age group at Cantonian High School who attended the following primary schools:

County Council of the City & County of Cardiff 30 January 2014

Primary School	No. of Pupils
Fairwater	24
Herbert Thompson	3
Hywel Dda	1
Kitchener	1
Lansdowne	1
Ninian Park	1
Pentrebane	12
Peter Lea	14
Radnor	1
St Francis	1
St Paul's	1
Severn	2
Trelai	1
Primary school not within Cardiff	1
TOTAL =	64

<u>ENVIRONMENT – WRITTEN QUESTIONS: COUNCIL, 30 JANUARY</u> 2014

W19 WRITTEN QUESTION FROM COUNTY COUNCILLOR FORD

How many reports of flooding have been reported in Cardiff since 01-09-13 until the 16-01-14? Please include drains.

Reply

The term 'flooding' is now commonly used to describe localised standing water along the highway and surface water run off from overlying land. Although the Council will endeavour to attend and investigate all reported flooding incidents, it is only considered to be an actual flooding event if properties are flooded internally or in imminent danger of being flooded.

During the period from 1 September 2013 to 16 January 2014, the Council received 740 requests regarding 'flooding' incidents across the city. No properties were reported to have been flooded internally during this period, with the majority of requests relating to localised ponding issues caused by a number of circumstances.

Localised ponding issues are commonly caused by either blocked highway gullies, highway gullies becoming covered over with debris/leaf fall or hydraulic overload of the public sewers. Whilst blocked gullies and drainage systems can be addressed through planned maintenance and engineering improvements, leaf fall and debris is a natural phenomenon and is therefore unpredictable and cannot be influenced by the maintenance teams.

When a flooding request is received by the Council it is added to a list of other reported incidents for the operational crews to inspect and cleanse accordingly. Dependant on the number of requests received and resources available, the requests will predominantly be dealt with on the same day or earlier if the report of flooding is likely to cause internal flooding to properties or major disruption across the city. This process will also apply during out of hours and over the weekend period where there is a 24-hour call out response team.

It is worth noting that, over the last few months, Cardiff has experienced unprecedented levels of rainfall along with many other parts of the country and the Council, together with our partner agencies, have managed to

	prevent any significant flooding events where properties have been flooded internally.
W20	WRITTEN QUESTION FROM COUNTY COUNCILLOR FORD
	How many complaints has the Council received regarding parking at the Central train and bus station since 01-01-13 and what has been done to alleviate it?
	<u>Reply</u>
	Following a check of records held, I am advised that only one recorded letter on this matter was entered into the system in 2013. This was received from a Cardiff Councillor. Additionally, there have been two complaints relating to taxis, which were received on 18 March 2013 and 21 October 2013.
	I can confirm that Civil Enforcement Officers do currently enforce contraventions in this area when they are identified and they will continue regular patrols as is normal practice.
	Civil Enforcement Officers may only issue Penalty Charge Notices where there is clear evidence of a contravention of yellow line restrictions. However, in many cases, taxi drivers are with their vehicles and either move forward or leave the area when Civil Enforcement Officers arrive in the area, which does make enforcement difficult. Contravention of yellow line restrictions can be considered as obstruction of the highway, which is also an offence, but this is a matter that may only be dealt with by the Police.
	In order to assist in addressing parking concerns, a formal taxi rank has been introduced in the vicinity of the front of Cardiff Central railway station. This has provided more space for other vehicles wishing to gain access to the front of the station in order to pick up or drop off rail passengers and appears to have reduced problems in this location. The situation will continue to be monitored.
W21	WRITTEN QUESTION FROM COUNTY COUNCILLOR FORD
	What has been the estimate for extra car/van journeys caused by the closure

of Waungron Road recycling centre?

How many miles will this be?

Reply

This is dependant on the customers' home address and their choice of alternative site. It may be a shorter distance for some and longer for others. It is envisaged that 90% of current site users at Waungron will transfer to Bessemer Close, but ultimately this is customer choice, and will be influenced by the success of our marketing.

It is worth noting the proposals also include:

- 1. reduction in site vehicle movements and skip changes due to improved material management and crushing on site.
- 2. improved customer throughput due to larger site and more staff facilitating the process.
- 3. reduced idling and waiting time during busier periods on site due to better throughput
- 4. reduction on impact on main road outside of Waungron site which has led to customer dissatisfaction previously
- 5. promotion of use of kerbside as much as possible to reduce need to use HRC sites

Considerations

- Only the residents directly surrounding the current Waungron site would need to travel further.
- Residents more than mile away would use an alternative site as the route and journey time would be a more viable option.
- Having the 2 sites will enable less heavy vehicles operating on the highway and reducing the carbon foot print. (less sites to manage the waste) We are reducing our fleet of lorries for skip lifts from 4 to 2.
- WRAP HWRC Guidance October 2012 page 97 refers to distance and time travelled to sites and states that an authority should consider these factors. It references authorities where 20 minutes and 10 miles are deemed to be reasonable.
- The planning application will consider any impacts on traffic.

	Data from Google Maps re journey times and mileage.	
	CF52JL (Waungron HWRC) to CF118XH (Bessemer HWRC) = 8 mins – 2.8 Miles	
	CF52JL (Waungron HWRC) to CF143QX (Wedal Rd HWRC) = 8 mins – 2.7 Miles	
	CF52JL (Waungron HWRC) to CF32HP (Lamby Way HWRC) = 11 mins - 6.2 Miles	
W22	WRITTEN QUESTION FROM COUNTY COUNCILLOR FORD	
	How much has it cost for the removal of fly tipping in the city since 01-06-13 to 01-01-14?	
	<u>Reply</u>	
	It has cost £164,140 to remove and dispose of fly tipping across the city between June 2013 and December 2013. This figure is comprised of £85,504 to fund the removal of fly tipped materials by teams, which includes the cost of a vehicle, fuel and maintenance, driver and an operative. The remainder of the cost (£78,636) covered the disposal of 763 tonnes of waste.	
W23	WRITTEN QUESTION FROM COUNTY COUNCILLOR FORD	
	When will the toilets be reopened on the Hayes in the town centre?	
	<u>Reply</u>	
	You will recall that, in order to meet budget savings targets for the 2013/14 financial year, the Council took the difficult decision in February last year to close the Hayes Public Conveniences. The facilities were subsequently closed on 30 June 2013, thereby saving the Council approximately £120,000 per annum. The Public Convenience Attendants have since been redeployed or left the Council through voluntary severance.	
	However, in implementing the Council's decision to close the facilities, the Cabinet recognised the historical value of the Grade 2 listed structure and	

	undertook to investigate the feasibility of re-opening the public conveniences at no or minimum cost to the Council.	
	To this end, officers have been investigating the feasibility of securing the operation and maintenance of the toilets through an alternative delivery model. I am therefore very pleased to confirm that an agreement has recently been reached with the Hayes Café tenant to operate and maintain these facilities without the Council incurring any net additional cost. It is intended that the facilities will be re-opened within the next few months.	
	Further details regarding this alternative service delivery model will be outlined in a report which is scheduled for consideration by Cabinet in March 2014.	
W24	WRITTEN QUESTION FROM COUNTY COUNCILLOR FORD	
	How many complaints have you received since it has been closed?	
	Reply	
	I am aware of two complaints which have been received by the Council following the Council's decision to close the toilets in February 2013.	
W25	WRITTEN QUESTION FROM COUNTY COUNCILLOR FORD	
	Have signs on the Hayes been put up to advise residents of Cardiff and visitors where else to go to use a toilet?	
	<u>Reply</u>	
	Yes, appropriate signs were put up when the toilets were closed. However, these do 'disappear' from time-to-time and, therefore, new signs are put up as and when required.	
W26	WRITTEN QUESTION FROM COUNTY COUNCILLOR McEVOY	
	How many cleansing hours were worked in Fairwater, Canton, Creigiau and Riverside for the weeks of:	
	 08-01-14 until 15-01-14; 07-01-13 until 14-01-13; 09-01-12 until 16-01-12? 	

<u>Reply</u>

I am advised that the hours actually worked by teams in individual wards are not recorded. As a result, the information provided below includes the hours of work scheduled for the requested periods, but do not account for absences because of leave, training, etc.

Ward	Approximate Working Hours Scheduled			
	09-01-12 until 16-01-12	07-01-13 until 14-01-13	08-01-14 until 15-01-14	
Fairwater	133	133	177	
Canton	281	266	236	
Creigiau / St Fagans	33	33	29	
Riverside	362	347	364	

The 'Cardiff Outdoors Project – Street Cleansing' report, which was considered by the Cabinet in December 2013, identified proposed changes to the street cleansing operations and a move to a more 'needs based' focus. These changes were implemented in mid-January 2014. It can be seen from the information provided that Fairwater is currently benefiting from the ongoing 'Cardiff Outdoors' trial in the ward, where a team based in the area is cleansing the adopted highway, parks and housing land.

In respect of Canton and Riverside, the main reason for the reduction in hours relates to the change in role of the Community Sweepers. As stated in the aforementioned report to Cabinet in December 2013, an important step in achieving the 'needs based' focus is the provision of a more flexible and responsive resource deployment. To achieve this, the Community Sweepers, whose hard work has been restricted to relatively small areas, have been reintegrated within the rest of the workforce and now work as part of Transit vehicle-based operative teams that are able to cover significantly larger areas to the wider benefits of communities. Hence, the changes have resulted in a more efficient approach to cleansing across the city.

W27	WRITTEN Q	UESTION FROM	COUNTY COUN	NCILLOR McEVO	Y
	What is the val	ue of Waungron Roa	ad Recycling Dep	ot?	
	<u>Reply</u>				
	whether the sit timing of any s and, if approve maximise the	e might have special sale. The proposed c ed, may take some to value received by t	l value for a parti closure of the site time to reach a s the Authority. It	(and planning state cular buyer and also is still being conside ale position designed would be likely that too early to fix a va	the red 1 to t it
W28	WRITTEN Q	UESTION FROM	COUNTY COUN	NCILLOR McEVO	Y
	10 years, pleas <u>Reply</u>	e indicate the amoun	nt per year?	ecycling depot in the ast 10 years are set	
	Financial	Gross	Grant Income	Net Expenditure	
	Year	Expenditure (£)	(£)	(£)	
	2012/13	172,026		110,899	
	2011/12	153,420	-48,809	104,611	
	2010/11	184,670	-60,942	123,728	
	2009/10	224,649	-70,834	153,815	
	2008/09	160,321	-50,707	109,614	
	2007/08	212,016		135,206	
	2006/07	271,346	-75,979	195,367	
	2005/06	181,396	-57,093	124,303	
	2004/05	141,917	-49,735	92,182	
	2003/04	311,788		311,788	
	TOTAL =	2,013,549	-552,036	1,461,513	
W29				<u>NCILLOR McEVO</u>	

<u>Reply</u>

On 16 September 2013, the Traffic Regulation Order team wrote to the local ward members for Riverside about increased residents parking and to update them on 75% Resident Only Parking Scheme surveys, which would be undertaken in Gloucester Street.

Surveys were carried out to establish whether the existing reserved space was heavily used during the working day from Monday to Friday. If an occupancy level of 75% or more of legal parking is observed in the existing bays, then an upgrade to a 75% scheme would therefore be justified.

The results of the surveys indicated that the overall percentage parked in Gloucester Street was found to be 47%, which is below the Council's criteria for the introduction of a 75% Residents Only Parking Scheme. This means that the request for an extension of the existing Residents Only Parking provision could not be supported at this time.

It should be noted that the new Residents Parking Policy limits the number of permits per dwelling to two plus a visitor permit. It is anticipated that, as residents renew their permits, there may be a reduction in the perceived parking pressure within the existing bays as less permits will be issued.

FINANCE AND ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT – WRITTEN QUESTIONS: COUNCIL, 30 JANUARY 2014

WRITTEN QUESTION FROM COUNTY COUNCILLOR BRIDGES
What is the cost to the council of printing and mailing out payslips to employees?
What consideration has been given to issuing payslips over e-mail every month to employees with a secure council e-mail address?
Reply
The projected postage costs for mailing payslips to employees for the $2013/14$ financial year is £30,231. The cost of payslip stationery and envelopes is £7,230 per annum.
The use of electronic payslips has been investigated with our Technology Partner, but the upfront cost of implementation and associated support costs has meant that there is not a viable business case at the present time unless all employees agree to use this method.
WRITTEN QUESTION FROM COUNTY COUNCILLOR McEVOY
How much did the Leader of the Council, Deputy Leaders, Cabinet (Executive members) earn in allowances from 01-07-12 to 01-07-13 and 01-07-10 to 01-07-11?
Reply
From 1 July 2012 to 1 July 2013, the total amount of Senior Salaries (inclusive of Basic Salary) earned by the Leader, Deputy Leader and seven other Cabinet Members was £313,100. Payments were made in accordance with the levels of Senior Salary prescribed by the Independent Remuneration Panel for Wales in its Annual Reports.

WRITTEN QUESTION FROM COUNTY COUNCILLOR McEVOY W32 How many letters were received from Cardiff MPs and AMs regarding the new bus station from: a) May 1st 2008 – May 1st 2012 b) from May $3^{rd} 2012 - 16-01-14?$ Could you list the sender of number of letters per month please? **Reply** Please see below list of correspondence received during the following periods: May 1st 2008 – May 1st 2012 a) Date Sender No September 2009 MP 2 February 2010 AM 1 August 2011 MP 1 February 2012 AM 1 from May 3rd 2012 – January 16th 2014 b) None. WRITTEN QUESTION FROM COUNTY COUNCILLOR McEVOY W33 How much has been spent on taxis by cabinet councillors since May 3rd 2012? Reply Figures available up to the end of September 2013 show that Cabinet Members have claimed expenses or incurred costs to the Council on taxi fares totalling £118.60 since 3^{rd} May 2012. W34 WRITTEN QUESTION FROM COUNTY COUNCILLOR McEVOY What was the cost of the Riverside and Splott by elections?

<u>Reply</u>

The costs of the Council by-elections in Riverside and Splott, which were held on 5 December 2013, were as follows:

Riverside = £16,536.67 Splott = £16,139.36

LEADER – WRITTEN QUESTIONS: COUNCIL, 30 JANUARY 2014

W35	WRITTEN QUESTION FROM COUNTY COUNCILLOR McEVOY
	To which Secretary of State is the Cardiff Partnership accountable?
	<u>Reply</u>
	The Cardiff Partnership is accountable to the local statutory partners and the Welsh Government. The Partnership does not report to any Secretary of State.

SPORT, LEISURE AND CULTURE – WRITTEN QUESTIONS: COUNCIL, 30 JANUARY 2014

W36	WRITTEN QUESTION FROM COUNTY COUNCILLOR BOWDEN
	Has the Council undertaken a survey of the great crested newt population in Heath Park during the past 12 months?
	f so, could you tell me:
	 What were the results and what did the survey reveal in terms of the extent of the great-crested newts' spread of habitat?; Are you satisfied that the great crested newt population is norreducing in Heath Park but maintaining a healthy level?; Does the Council need to take further measures to protect this protected species in Heath Park e.g. fencing off the pond area to prevent access by dogs and children which could disturb the habitat?; Are there any other parts of Cardiff which support a significant greater crested newt population?
	Reply
	1. A survey of the Great Crested Newt breeding pond in Heath Park was undertaken in spring 2013 by East Ecology. This survey used a variety of methods to estimate the numbers of this species within the pond and the resulting assessment was that the population was at the lower end of the 'medium population' category - i.e. between 10 and 100 adult newts. A survey of the terrestrial habitat of this species was not undertaken as it is difficult to survey for this species on land in a systematic way and terrestrial surveys do not normally give useful results.
	2. Annual surveys of this pond by Parks Services staff do not indicate that the population is declining. Small numbers are detected every year and the breeding habitat remains broadly suitable for them.
	B. Preventing dog access to the pond may reduce turbidity and therefore allow more submerged vegetation to grow, providing better habita for the newts. However, there is no evidence that the Great Crested Newt population is constrained by the lack of submerged vegetation at this site. The increase in the opportunity for submerged plan

	 plant species 'Parrots Feath to control its spread. 4. There are significant Grea Cardiff, in particular ar 	increase the problems with the ther, which is hand-pulled annual t Crested Newt populations to the ound the St Fagans, Goitre-we believe that there are 14 poliff.	ly in order he west of Fawr and
11/27			
W37	WRITTEN QUESTION FROM	I COUNTY COUNCILLOR BO	<u>OYLE</u>
	What is the rate of occupancy in a	ach of the city's allotments?	
	what is the fate of occupancy in o	each of the city's anotherits?	
	Reply		
	The current occupancy rates for e	ach allotment site are as follows:	
	Allotment Site Name	Occupancy Rate	
	Allensbank	78%	
	Birchgrove	86%	
	Colchester Avenue	92%	
	College Farm	72%	
	Cowbridge Road	85%	
	Elgar Crescent	95%	
	Ely Farm	75%	
	Fairwater	68%	
	Flaxland Avenue	56%	
	Forest Farm	82%	
	Greenway Road	68%	
	Heol Chappell	94%	
	Highfields	92%	
	Lady Mary	78%	
	Leckwith	65%	
	Llandaff Fields	96%	
	Llandaff North	79%	
	Llanishen	83%	
	Lon y Deri	100%	
	Lynton Terrace	77%	
	Pengam Pavilion	72%	
	Pengam Permanent	17%	

County Council of the City & County of Cardiff 30 January 2014

	Pontcanna A	86%	
	Pontcanna Chalet	100%	
	Pontcanna Permanent	91%	
	Porthamal Road	100%	
	Rhydypenau	89%	
	South Rise	82%	
	Overall Total Occupancy Rate =	78%	
W38	WRITTEN QUESTION FROM COU	NTY COUNCILLOF	R BOYLE
	Is the council able to produce a demogr by age, gender and ethnicity?	aphic breakdown of al	lotment users,
	Reply		
	From information held by the Council confirm that 66% of the tenant population		-
	In terms of age, 53% of the tenant popul 47% are under 60 years of age.	lation are aged 60 yea	rs or over and
	The Council does not hold information however, arrangements are in hand to monitoring equalities data.	•	•
W39	WRITTEN QUESTION FROM COU	NTY COUNCILLOF	R BOYLE
	What has been the percentage year-by 2008?	y-year rise in plot ren	tal fees since
	<u>Reply</u>		
	The percentage increases year-by-year s	ince 2008 are as follow	vs:
	2008 = 2.8%		
	2009 = 15.1%		
	2010 = 5.2%		
	2011 = 12.9%		
	2012 = 11.1%		
	2013 = 37%		
	2014 = 36.9%		

	The increases for the 2014 allotment year will result in charges for individual allotment plots ranging from £24.75p per year for a small plot at a concessionary rate, through to £105.40p for a large plot without a concession
W40	WRITTEN QUESTION FROM COUNTY COUNCILLOR BOYLE
	What is the total cost to the Council of running the allotment service?
	<u>Reply</u>
	Taking the current financial year and using outturn projections at the Month 8 monitoring period, I anticipate that the net expenditure for the allotment service to be £69,860. This figure is based on a projected expenditure total of £165,460, minus a projected income total of £95,600.
W41	WRITTEN QUESTION FROM COUNTY COUNCILLOR BOYLE
	How many eviction notices are outstanding on non-payers?
	<u>Reply</u>
	194 non-renewal notices due to non-payment were issued on 16 December 2013, with payment due by 13 January 2014.
	85 payments have been received following the issue of these notices and 109 payments remain outstanding.
W42	WRITTEN QUESTION FROM COUNTY COUNCILLOR BRIDGES
	What plans does the administration have to create a playground in or near the city centre for families with young children?
	<u>Reply</u>
	There are no current plans or, indeed, budget allocations to create a playground in or near the city centre for families with young children. I can however confirm that new play features designed for families with young children have been introduced in Bute Park during the current financial year, which comprise of a series of play sculptures, balance beams, stepping logs, stepping posts, play stilts and a rope walk. These features have installed

	through the use of H	Heritage Lottery Fund monies.	
	Despenser Gardens will be completed	ancement works are planned for the pla within the Riverside ward and I anticipate that by the end of the financial year. These work tion 106 monies and the capital programme.	at the works
W43	WRITTEN QUES	TION FROM COUNTY COUNCILLOR N	AcEVOY
	Can you list the ma	jor events in Cardiff and their cost since May	1 st 2012?
	<u>Reply</u>		
	Since May 1 st 2012,	, Cardiff has hosted the following Major Even	ts:
	Date	Event	Cost
	25 May 2012	Olympic Torch Relay	see Note 1
	8-10 June 2012	ICF Canoe Slalom World Cup	see Note 2
	23 June 2012	BIM British Speedway	£17K
	25 July 2012	Olympic Football Match and first event of the London 2012 Games	
	26 July 2012	Olympic Football Match	
	28 July 2012	Olympic Football Match	
	31 July 2012	Olympic Football Match	see Note
	1 August 2012	Olympic Football Match	
	3 August 2012	Olympic Football Match	
	4 August	Olympic Football Match	
	10 August	Olympic Football Bronze Medal Match	
	31 Aug-2 Sept 2012	Extreme Sailing Series	see Note 2
	19-21 April 2013	RHS Show Cardiff	£48K

1 June 2013	BIM British Speedway	£17K
6 June 2013	ICC Champions Trophy	
9 June 2013	ICC Champions Trophy	
14 June 2013	ICC Champions Trophy	see Not 3
16 June 2013	ICC Champions Trophy	
20 June 2013	ICC Champions Trophy – Semi Final	
21-23 June 2013	ICF Canoe Slalom World Cup	
		see Not
23-26 August 2013	Extreme Sailing Series	2
23-27 Oct 2013	Womex 2013	£35K
26 Oct 2013	Opening Ceremony Rugby League World Cup 2013	£100K

Notes:

- 1. The London 2012 Olympics was a UK Bid. The support captured in the Guarantee Letters signed by all host authorities and provided to the International Olympic Committee (IOC) as part of the bid commitments formed part of the Host City Contract and captured the UK's collective commitment to deliver the Olympic and Paralympic Games in 2012. Cardiff contributed £350K to the costs of staging Olympic Football Games, the Olympic Torch Relay and the Paralympic Flame Festival in the City.
- 2. These events are funded by Cardiff Harbour Authority (CHA). There is no cost directly to CHA for the ICF Canoe Slalom World Cup and the contribution towards the Extreme Sailing Series is £10K.

3.No direct funding – facilitation and officer support only.W44WRITTEN OUESTION FROM COUNTY COUNCILLOR McEVOY

When did the Ely Rec not form part of Cardiff's proposed fields to be put into Trust?

Reply

On 20 September 2012, the Cabinet took the decision to put forward seven candidate sites for dedication under the Queen Elizabeth II Fields Challenge initiative. I believe that your question is referring to the Wilson Road Recreation Ground in Ely – this site was not included as one of the seven sites.

<u>STRATEGIC PLANNING AND TRANSPORT – WRITTEN QUESTIONS:</u> <u>COUNCIL, 30 JANUARY 2014</u>

W45 WRITTEN QUESTION FROM COUNTY COUNCILLOR BRIDGES

In July, officers met with South Wales Police and Gabalfa ward councillors to discuss problem parking at Africa Gardens. It was requested by both ward members at the meeting that consideration be given to installing bollards to prevent dangerous parking on the ends of the islands. As well as improving driver visibility and pedestrian safety, this would also give a clear indication to residents of where it is safe to park and where it is not. What update can you give me on the specific suggestion of installing bollards at this location?

<u>Reply</u>

This issue has been investigated and, although parking in the area is considered to be unsafe, an analysis of the police road casualty database has revealed that there have been no injury related incidents within Africa Gardens over a five year period.

In view of the accident history, we cannot justify the implementation of significant works using the limited road safety funds available. It is therefore proposed that parking is restricted using double yellow lines and dropped kerbs are provided for pedestrian access.

If funding becomes available from other sources, bollards will be installed to further enforce the restrictions. However, it is understood that there is a high demand for parking in the area and, although parking provision will be kept to a maximum, there is likely to be strong objections to these proposals.

W46 WRITTEN QUESTION FROM COUNTY COUNCILLOR BRIDGES

What plans does the administration have to secure the development of a Mynachdy/Talybont train station as part of its Local Development Plan?

<u>Reply</u>

The Cardiff Local Development Plan 2006-2026 (Deposit) makes provision for the development of rail stations. Policy T3 (i) (TRANSPORT INTERCHANGES) provides support for:

"New rail stations which can be easily accessed by walking, cycling and local bus services, facilitate rail park and ride, where appropriate, and meet the access needs of all users..."

The Deposit LDP does not include proposals for a Mynachdy/Talybont train station and there are no proposals for these stations within the SEWTA South East Wales Regional Rail Strategy (2013). However, the recently published impact study for the Cardiff Capital Region Metro proposals does identify potential new rail stations at Gabalfa, Maindy, Wedal Road and Crwys Road.

These proposals are concepts and would require detailed investigation to establish their technical and financial feasibility in the context of the planned electrification of the Valley Lines rail network and the wider Metro proposals.

A report which will provide further information on the Metro project is currently being prepared and is expected to be considered by the Cabinet in February 2014. The report will seek the Cabinet's formal endorsement of the Metro proposals and approval for officers to engage with Welsh Government, and key transport and other stakeholders, on the delivery of the Metro plan, in conjunction with the implementation proposals relating to the Cardiff LDP and the Central Cardiff Enterprise Zone.

<u>CHAIR OF PLANNING COMMITTEE – WRITTEN QUESTIONS:</u> <u>COUNCIL, 30 JANUARY 2014</u>

W47 WRITTEN QUESTION FROM COUNTY COUNCILLOR BOWDEN

Given that the great crested newt species has European protected status, and that there is a large population known to be in existence in Heath Park and in gardens surrounding the Park, do you have any plans to ask residents in the localised area who wish to undertake developments on their properties which involve minor excavation such as replacement of driveways and paving slabs, to submit a planning application for such work? In addition, will the Council require evidence that the resident has undertaken a great crested newt survey and considered the adverse effect on Priority Habitat or Species within its proposals?

<u>Reply</u>

If an activity which might affect great crested newts requires planning consent, then the Authority has a duty to ensure the protection of those species in granting that consent. However, given the distance of private properties from the newts' breeding pond in Heath Park and the type of works described, the impact of those works on the newts would be minor, if any at all.

This is because research has shown that the vast majority of great crested newts live within 250 metres of their breeding pond and there is plenty of suitable terrestrial habitat in the form of woodland and grassland in the vicinity that the newts can use and which is much closer to the breeding pond.

Given that any impact would be minor at worst, it is not practical to invoke protected species legislation and ask for a terrestrial great crested newt survey to be undertaken every time a householder planning application is made in the vicinity of Heath Park.

Where an activity falls outside the planning system or does not otherwise require consent or authorisation from the Authority, then the Council has no remit with respect to protected species. If a protected species or its habitat is harmed or damaged by those activities, then that is a police matter.

The Park Rangers, the Parks Conservation Officer and the County Ecologist

will continue to work proactively to ensure that the pond in Heath Park and the surrounding habitat continues to support great crested newts and other wildlife, as well as raising awareness of these species through events such as pond-dipping and wildlife walks.

<u>CHAIR OF STANDARDS AND ETHICS COMMITTEE –</u> <u>WRITTEN QUESTIONS: COUNCIL, 30 JANUARY 2014</u>

W48	WRITTEN QUESTION FROM COUNTY COUNCILLOR McEVOY
	How many Ombudsman's complaints have been made about Cardiff councillors since May 1 st 2012 till the present day?
	Please anonymously list the number of complaints per councillor or former councillor?
	How many complaints have been made by fellow councillors about each councillor?
	<u>Reply</u>
	Complaints made to the Public Services Ombudsman for Wales may be made directly to the Ombudsman's office without involving the Council. Although the Monitoring Officer is often copied into correspondence, the Council is not in a position to confirm definitively the exact number of complaints made. For the same reason, we are not able to confirm the number of complaints per Councillor or the number of complaints made by Councillors against fellow Councillors.
	The following statistics are taken from the Ombudsman's recent Annual Reports and indicate the total number of formal complaints made to the Ombudsman alleging breaches of the Code of Conduct:
	Code of Conduct Complaints against Members of Cardiff Council 2012/2013 Annual Report = 3 2011/2012 Annual Report = 6
	Members will be aware of the recently adopted Local Resolution Protocol that has been adopted to deal with "Member on Member" allegations of minor breaches of the Code of Conduct. As a result of such complaints being handled at a local level, it is hoped that the number of complaints being made to the Ombudsman will reduce.
	Following the adoption of this protocol, the Monitoring Officer is reviewing how such complaints are handled and recorded and will be working with the Committee to apply any changes that are identified as being necessary.

County Council of the City & County of Cardiff 30 January 2014

509

Signed: _____

Date: _____